

AGRICULTURAL AND DRAINAGE WORKS.

Works for which neither Capital nor Revenue Accounts are kept.

WORKS IN PROGRESS.

Government embankments ...	4,87,048	} 8,92,665	{ 5,42,165	7,19,569	} 7,67,300	8,33,914	6,24,000
Midnapore Takavi embankments under contract ...	64,356						
Gandak Takavi embankments under contract ...	84,163						
Rajpur and Howrah drainage ...	14,852						
Magra Hat drainage project ...	1,14,503						
Total Agricultural ...	7,44,724	8,92,665	6,24,042	8,19,180	7,67,300	8,33,914	6,24,000
Reserve	49,700	50,000
Deduct for rounding	(-) 34
Total in charge of the Public Works Department ...	16,86,998	21,57,993	19,06,731	18,77,214	20,26,000	19,93,000	21,31,000

Revised includes Rs. 20,624 for expenditure on Ghora Katra Irrigation Scheme in the district of Patna, and Rs. 3,250 for silt clearance of Harikhally and Chunamara Khals in the district of Midnapur.

45.—Civil Works—

IN CHARGE OF THE CIVIL DEPARTMENT.							
Ferry charges ...	7	4,831	3,832	2,179	6,209	4,000	6,626
„ refunds ...	29,546	26,305	28,696	25,376	28,000	23,000	27,000
Staging bungalows ...	6,994	6,394	6,227	6,766	8,506	7,000	8,520
Encamping grounds ...	193	656	1,166	624	1,332	1,000	1,216
Contributions in aid of Excluded Local Funds and Municipalities ...	1,45,600	1,32,469	1,47,138	3,69,359	7,49,000	6,70,000	10,60,000
Other charges	2,000	2,000	2,000
Reserve for buildings, etc.	64,000
Contribution to District Funds and District Road Funds	12,78,000	11,24,000	13,81,000
Forewording	-47	-362
Total in charge of the Civil Department ...	1,52,340	1,70,524	1,57,059	4,04,293	21,35,000	18,31,000	24,26,000
IN CHARGE OF THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.							
<i>Original Works.</i>							
Civil Buildings { In progress ..	} 29,96,172	} 33,47,864	} 37,14,370	} 38,22,254	{ 17,86,400	} 32,14,000	{ 11,31,000
{ Not commenced							
Communications { In progress ...	} 1,15,384	} 4,01,334	} 1,82,236	} 2,96,528	{ 2,01,800	} 70,000	{ 1,40,000
{ Not commenced							
Miscellaneous Public Improvements { In progress ..	} 1,15,384	} 4,01,334	} 1,82,236	} 2,96,528	{ 33,900	} 70,000	{ 10,000
{ Not commenced							
Total ...	33,30,811	40,49,910	42,38,822	46,30,111	29,37,400	35,66,000	17,13,000

Estimate based on the average of the last three years.

Budget includes 4½ lakhs for works of sanitary improvement sanctioned by the Government of India.

Budget includes 2 lakhs for feeder roads, and Rs. 9,13,000 for grants to District Boards to augment their resources.

HEADS.	1904-05.	1905-06.	1906-07.	1907-08.	1908-09.		1909-10.	REMARKS.
	Actuals.	Actuals.	Actuals.	Actuals.	Budget estimate.	Revised estimate.	Budget estimate.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
IN CHARGE OF THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT—concl'd.								
* <i>Repairs.</i>								
Civil Buildings	5,37,351	4,52,869	5,03,567	5,46,123	5,08,600		5,50,000	
Communications	8,67,747	7,63,245	9,17,326	9,00,619	9,50,000		10,00,000	
Miscellaneous Public Improve- ments	69,700	59,160	67,629	56,739	1,00,000		50,000	
Total	14,74,798	12,65,274	14,88,522	15,03,481	15,58,600	14,48,000	16,00,000	
Establishment	9,31,378	9,21,616	8,46,362	9,59,300	10,00,849	10,20,000	11,46,406	
Tools and Plant	64,022	55,407	1,31,337	64,906	74,151	6,8000	50,594	
Stock and Suspense	36,909	—13,480	—11,615	96,135	74,600	
Total in charge of Public Works Department	58,37,918	62,78,627	66,93,428	72,53,933	55,71,000	61,76,000	45,10,000	
GRAND TOTAL	60,20,258	64,49,151	68,80,497	76,58,226	77,98,000	80,07,000	69,96,000	

Contribution from Provincial to Local—

Land Revenue	32,000	38,000	69,000					} Grants now included under service heads.
Provincial Rates					
Police	1,000					
Education	3,000	55,000					
Medical	5,000	29,000	10,000					
Scientific and other Minor Departments	4,000	6,000	4,000					
Miscellaneous	29,000	1,000	15,20,000					
Covering Deficit	7,70,000	7,16,000					
Civil Works	2,28,000	14,84,000	6,55,000					
Famine Relief	3,12,000					
Reserve					
Total	10,68,000	23,77,000	26,26,000	19,19,000				

APPENDIX C.

Receipts and Expenditure of District Boards and District Road Funds.
(The figures in column 4 are those passed by the Commissioners of Divisions).

RECEIPTS.

HEADS OF REVENUE.	Actuals, 1907-08	Revised estimate, 1908-09.	Budget estimate, 1909-10.	REMARKS.
1	2	3	4	5
I.—Land Revenue (Proper) ...	Rs.	Rs. 30,543	Rs. 27,140	Represents contribution from Provincial Revenue for improvements in Government estates in the Sonthal Parganas hitherto shown under contributions.
VI.—Provincial Rates ...	36,40,658	35,57,749	36,03,563	Represents collections from Road Cess.
XII.—Interest ...	33,932	38,217	34,204	Represents interest on arrear collections of Road Cess and on Government securities belonging to Education, Medical and other departments.
XVII.—Police ...	3,43,488	3,21,579	3,36,888	Represents receipts from Pounds.
XIX.—Education ...	44,318	6,51,434	5,73,748	Represents fees and other receipts from schools. Revised and Budget include grants of Rs. 5,73,000 and Rs. 5,45,000, respectively, from Provincial Revenues in addition to net receipts from Ferries, Pounds, etc., which were localized on the introduction of the Local Self Government Act. These contributions were formerly shown under Contributions.
XX.—Medical ...	50,857	93,349	90,313	Both Revised and Budget include grants from Provincial Revenues in the districts of Puri, Sambalpur, etc., formerly shown under Contributions.
XXI.—Scientific and other Minor Departments ...	14,710	27,349	27,540	Both Revised and Budget include grants from Provincial Revenues toward Veterinary establishments formerly shown under Contributions.
XXIII.—Stationery and Printing ...	1,298	2,621	2,699	
XXV.—Miscellaneous ...	1,29,312	4,59,245	2,65,214	This is a very fluctuating head of receipts.
XXX.—Irrigation-Minor Works and Navigation in charge of Civil Department ...	5,659	7,321	5,100	
XXXI.—Civil Works in charge of the Civil Department ...	5,49,243	13,78,796	11,43,687	Both Revised and Budget include grants for augmenting the resources of District Boards and for Feeder-roads, etc.
Total Revenue ...	45,13,475	65,68,203	61,10,096	
Contributions from Provincial to Local ...	19,18,815	
Debt Head ...	30,58,925	11,49,011	7,64,929	
Opening Balance ...	29,98,120	30,67,475	14,09,717	
GRAND TOTAL ...	1,27,85,335	1,07,84,689	82,84,742	

EXPENDITURE.

HEADS OF EXPENDITURE.				Actuals, 1907-08.	Revised estimate, 1908-09.	Budget estimate, 1909-10.	REMARKS.
1				2	3	4	5
				Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
1	Refunds and Drawbacks	8,008	632	35	
8	Land Revenue	29,285	28,597	84,549	
8	Provincial Rates	1,89,111	1,49,588	1,50,741	Revised and Budget include Rs 1,46,000 and Rs 1,48,000, respectively, on account of proportional cost of collection of Road Cess, Valuation and re-valuation work and Certificate and Taus establishments.
14	Interest on other Obligations	7,334	12,126	11,778	
18	General Administration	.	..	2,04,144	2,83,408	2,14,988	
20	Police	30,672	41,373	37,091	
21	Ports and Pilotage	1,500	1,500	
22	Education	11,70,393	13,92,717	11,79,319	
24	Medical	4,06,419	4,78,826	4,49,975	
26	Scientific and other Minor Departments	62,685	74,280	70,782	
29	Superannuation Allowances and Pensions	32,707	39,345	39,553	
30	Stationery and Printing	47,148	44,898	38,449	
32	Miscellaneous	40,466	43,339	45,174	
33	Famine Relief	49,719	3,15,291	27,250	
43	Irrigation-Minor Works and Navigation in charge of Civil Department	4,36,634	3,50,000	This is for the Maghât Drainage Scheme
43	Irrigation-Minor Works and Navigation Public Works Department	3,76,955	
45	Civil Works (Civil)	46,74,688	54,02,655	40,24,848	Estimate based on local requirements.
Total Expenditure				73,29,629	86,95,204	66,76,032	
Contributions from Local to Provincial Debt Head				55,349	
Closing Balance				23,32,882	6,79,768	4,63,661	
				30,67,475	14,09,717	11,45,049	
GRAND TOTAL				1,27,85,335	1,07,84,689	82,84,742	

[*The President.*]

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT said:—"Gentlemen of the Council,—The Hon'ble Mr. Oldham has just told you that the Council will meet on Monday, the 5th April, to discuss the Financial Statement which he has just laid before you. In view of this, I have taken the opportunity to look over the proceedings of the last budget debate, and also to make certain inquiries. As a result of these inquiries, three facts have emerged, to which I shall make a very brief allusion just now.

"In the first place, I notice that the proceedings of the last debate ran to a most inordinate length. They occupied almost exactly 100 pages of small print. No less than 35 pages of these stand to the credit of one Hon'ble Member, and more modest contributions of 7 or 8 pages are quite common.

"Secondly, I notice that Sir Andrew Fraser had occasion to comment on the irrelevance of many of the subjects which were discussed by the various speakers. Some of them were not merely entirely foreign to the budget itself, but lay entirely outside the province of this Council altogether.

"Thirdly, rule 10 of the Rules of Business, which permits an Hon'ble Member to refer to notes for the purpose of refreshing his memory, but which forbids him from reading his speech, appears to have dropped out of sight, and I have reason to believe that some Hon'ble Members are not even aware of its existence at all. Indeed, as regards this last point, I am aware that there has been a good deal of license allowed in the past, and although that was not always the case—it certainly was not when I was a Member of this Council—and though I do not altogether like it, I am not going to interpret the rule very strictly unless I think the privilege is being abused. But the other two points mentioned appear to call for somewhat careful attention. The lengthy speeches of last year seem to me—well, I won't say an abuse, but they seem to be a misuse of the privilege of speech; and, so far from fulfilling any useful purpose, I think they merely serve to darken counsel. I am not going to dwell on this subject at great length now, because I may be laying myself open to the charge of committing the very offence of which I have been complaining; but it will be obvious to you that when this Council is doubled in size and when it holds greater powers of discussing matters, any such procedure would become absolutely impossible: it would bring the whole administration of the Province to a deadlock.

"I think it would have an excellent salutary effect if we endeavoured to anticipate, to some extent, the probable arrangements that will come into force when the Council Reform Scheme is introduced. It is certain that, under these conditions, the rules of relevance will have to be strictly enforced, and it may even be necessary to impose a time-limit on speakers.

"We need not pass any self-denying ordinance, or lay down any definite or arbitrary rule, but I venture to ask all Hon'ble Members who propose to speak on Monday, the 5th, to endeavour to make their speeches as brief as they can, and also to try to avoid wandering from the subject before the Council any more than they can possibly help."

The Council was then adjourned until Monday, the 5th April, 1909, at 10-30 A.M.

CALCUTTA;
The 5th April, 1909.

F. G. WIGLEY,
Secretary to the Bengal Council.

*Abstract of the Proceedings of the Council of the Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal,
assembled under the provisions of the Indian Councils Acts, 1861 and 1892.*

THE Council met in the Council Chamber on Monday, the 5th April, 1909, at 11 A.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble SIR EDWARD BAKER, K.C.S.I., Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal, *presiding*

The Hon'ble MR. F. A. SLACKE, C.S.I.

The Hon'ble MR. W. C. MACPHERSON, C.S.I.

The Hon'ble MR. E. W. COLLIN.

The Hon'ble MR. F. W. DUKE.

The Hon'ble MR. J. G. CUMMING.

The Hon'ble MR. C. E. A. W. OLDHAM.

The Hon'ble MR. A. S. THOMSON.

The Hon'ble SIR CHARLES ALLEN, Kt.

The Hon'ble MR. E. P. CHAPMAN.

The Hon'ble RAI KISHORI LAL GOSWAMI, BAHADUR, M.A., B.L.

The Hon'ble MAHARAJADHIRAJA SIR BIJAY CHAND MAHTAB BAHADUR, K.C.I.E.,
of Burdwan.

The Hon'ble BABU GAJADHAR PRASAD.

The Hon'ble BABU DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI, M.A., B.L.

The Hon'ble MR. F. A. LARMOUR.

The Hon'ble BABU RADHA CHARAN PAL.

The Hon'ble MR. M. S. DAS, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble IHTISHAM-UL-MULK RAESUDDOWLA AMIR-UL-OMRA NAWAL
ASEF KADR SYUD WASIF ALI MEERZA KHAN BAHADUR MAHABAT
JANG, Nawab Bahadur of Murshidabad.

The Hon'ble MR. C. W. N. GRAHAM.

[President ; Mr. Graham.]

BENGAL FINANCIAL STATEMENT FOR 1909-10.

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT said:—"I wish the Members to follow the practice which was introduced last year; and to call upon Hon'ble Members who have given notice of their intention to speak in their order of juniority; the non-official Members will speak first, and then the official Members to the right of the President, and then the official Members to the left of the President, ending with the Financial Secretary."

The Hon'ble MR. GRAHAM said:—"Your Honour, as the Financial Statement which we are to-day discussing all too plainly shows, we have just come through a bad year, and not only Government but Commerce, which I more particularly represent on this Council, has the same tale to tell, and can therefore all the more readily sympathise with the position which that Statement unfolds. In fact, the Budget, to a great extent, suffers from and reflects the general condition of trade during the past year.

"Under the circumstances, it would be worse than folly for me to press for more liberal grants for this or that item or project, seeing I should be asking for what is not there to be given.

"I will therefore confine myself to tendering the thanks of those I represent here, and my own, for the grants which it has been found possible to make towards those items in which we are more particularly interested.

"In the first place, it has been found possible to make a grant of Rs. 6,81,000 towards two schemes in which Calcutta trade is much interested. I refer to the Ultadanga-Bamanghatta Canal and the Madaripur Bhil route schemes, and I am certain that had we been discussing a prosperity budget, instead of the reverse, we should have found a considerably larger amount devoted to the opening up and improving of the great inland waterways of Bengal.

"Secondly, I note under the heading of Medical, the very greatly increased grants made to the hospitals and dispensaries, namely, Rs. 9,01,000, as against the budget estimate of last year Rs. 8,33,000, and in thanking Your Honour's Government for thus again so materially increasing those grants, I am only expressing the sentiments of the whole Calcutta community.

"While on this point, I would like to refer for a moment to the report of the Committee appointed by Sir Andrew Fraser to go into the question of the position and working of the Hospital Nurses' Institution. That Committee recommended, among other things, the raising, if possible, of an additional sum of between Rs. 50,000 and Rs. 60,000 annually from the public. Now I do not want to seem pessimistic, but my feeling is that certainly, as far as the European commercial community is concerned, something near the limit is being already subscribed. The figures show that while out of the total of about Rs 36,000 subscribed by the public last year, 97 per cent. was subscribed by that community, and only 3 per cent. by the Indian community. I bring this forward, so that should it be expected that this large annual increase in subscriptions is likely to be raised from the European community, too much faith may not be pinned on those expectations. On the other hand, I feel sure that the true state of the case, as shown by the figures in the report, has only to be realized by the Indian community at large, to be immediately rectified.

"I do not feel I should be justified in passing over entirely without comment the item on the Dr. side of the account, under the heading 'Law and Justice.' The estimate has been largely exceeded, and this is due to the proceedings necessitated by the outbreak of Anarchical crime in Bengal. It is scarcely necessary for me to say with what intense interest the Commercial community have followed the history of Anarchy and Sedition in the Province during the last year, and the means which Government have been employing to stamp them out. Throughout the trying time we have ever been ready to give Government our utmost support, and have ever been ready to strengthen their hands in their endeavours to put down this form of crime. We welcomed the special legislation, which was adopted in December last, and trust there will be no relaxation of the means now being employed, until the Province can be truly said to be free of every vestige of Anarchical conspiracy and crime.

[*Mr. Graham ; Nawab Bahadur of Murshidabad, Amir-ul-Omra.*]

“ There is one more point which I should like to mention, if I do not lay myself open to a charge of irrelevancy, but such a great question, as has recently been raised by the proposals of the Bengal and North-Western Railway Company to lease the Eastern Bengal State Railway, is so mixed up with Calcutta trade generally, and consequently with the financial questions of Bengal, that I think I am justified in referring to it here to-day. These proposals have been referred by the Railway Board to the Chamber of Commerce for their opinion, and the Chamber has been consulting its members and allied Associations very fully before replying to the Railway Board's note. The result has shown a very unanimous opinion, as expressed by all the different branches of trade in Calcutta, hostile to those proposals, and I can only hope, Sir, that you will find yourself in agreement with that opinion, and that your Government may see its way to add the weight of its support to our opposition to that scheme.”

The Hon'ble the NAWAB BAHADUR of Murshidabad, AMIR-UL-OMRA, said :—

“ YOUR HONOUR, I do not think I need take up the time of Hon'ble Members with any lengthy observations such as usually has been the practice on the last day of the Session. The present Budget offers few points of controversy ; and though the idea of the absence of a balance at the close of next year is far from encouraging or gratifying, it must be remembered how generously has expenditure to be provided for schemes of absolute necessity, how largely the resources of Government have been taxed by unforeseen events and what difficulties those responsible for a proper adjustment, adjudication and allotment of funds must necessarily feel to meet pressing demands and urgent requirements on all hands.

“ When one considers that the actual expenditure on Public Works has increased enormously, I do not say unnecessarily, and has aggregated more than the amounts assigned by the Government of India by over 107 lakhs of rupees ; that expenditures under the heads of Police and Education have rapidly increased ; that heavy charges have been made upon our finances for paying grain-compensation allowances by reason of a succession of bad agricultural years, consequent on want and unequal distribution of rain on the one hand and high floods on the other, resulting in the destruction of crops and a poor and insufficient outturn much below the normal—circumstances which have to a large extent affected seriously many parts of the Province and have necessarily affected the growth of Government Revenue and caused heavy drain upon the resources of Bengal, our closing balance, or rather its want, is easily explicable, and it is no wonder that from a substantial balance of nearly a crore in 1903-04 the balance at the close of the year will be nil.

“ It is much to be regretted that anarchism and sedition should not only injure the reputation of the country but also affect its resources and absorb its revenues. Your Honour, one can very well see that it is these and other unavoidable charges which have contributed to sweep away what would have been a much desirable balance at the end of the year, notwithstanding the special grant of about 17 lakhs of rupees which the Government of India have been pleased to make and for which we must all be grateful. I sincerely hope with my hon'ble friend in charge of the estimate that we shall not be confronted with a recurrence of bad seasons, untoward events or unlooked-for contingencies, and that our financial outlook will be better and more hopeful in the future so as to enable Government to provide for large new schemes and works, such as are of a pressing nature and undoubted importance and utility.

“ It is, however, a matter of congratulation that, notwithstanding this position of things, the Hon'ble Mr. Oldham has been able to provide for the normal expansion of the administration in many departments, besides making provision for special items of a recurring nature amounting to 11 lakhs of rupees.

“ The allotment for the increased salary of ministerial officers will be most welcome and will be thankfully received by a deserving and hard-worked class of public servants. I trust the provision for the improvement of the

[*Nawab Bahadur of Murshidabad, Amir-ul-Omra ; Mr. Das.*]

Calcutta Madrassa is but the first instalment of special Government patronage and will, I have little doubt, be appreciated by my co-religionists. The demands for its improvement were forcibly voiced at the Town Hall Meeting, and the claims of the Madrassa would not escape the notice and the treatment of a sympathetic Government.

"Your Honour, there are several other allotments in the Budget which call forth public appreciation and acknowledgment. The special allotment of over 10 lakhs for various objects, including charges for Guru training school buildings and training schools for female teachers, will be most welcome, as also the provision for the celebration of Empire Day in schools and colleges.

"Turning to the head of Medical Expenditure, I find an allotment of over a lakh of rupees for the Campbell Hospital alone, besides large grants to several hospitals. Your Honour, considering how largely that hospital is resorted to and how its resources are unfortunately taxed at times, any allotment to improve and increase its accommodation, staff, scope and usefulness would be money very well spent.

"There has, I observe, been a marked falling off in the receipts under the head of Irrigation, i.e., Minor Works and Navigation in charge of the Public Works Department. I find that decrease is chiefly in Navigation receipts from, among others, the Nadia Rivers. I have more than once urged the importance of dredging the Bhagirathi so as to keep open a navigable channel, and its importance is by no means lessened, much less removed, by reason of our having at no distant date lines of Railways on both sides of that river. The receipts under this head would, no doubt, increase if a channel with sufficient water could be kept open for navigation throughout the year. But the importance of the work is apparent from another point of view. The banks of the Bhagirathi are studded with important towns and villages, and as the river is the principal source of their water-supply, it is absolutely necessary that a current, unavoidable for a supply of good drinking water, should be kept up during the dry months, which will greatly improve the sanitation of those places. Already a dredger has, I understand, been ordered to be worked and is, I am informed, working at the mouth of the river, and I hope the labours of the Public Works Department will be maintained in the direction of continuing the work of dredging and of inducing into the stagnant rivers of the Nadia Division an ample supply of fresh water from the Ganges.

"I trust also that the labours of the Malaria Commission will not be allowed to rest till there is material improvement in the health and sanitation of the people of Bengal, especially the malaria-stricken districts—a subject which, along with the question of improving the water-supply of our villages, will, I trust, always engage our serious consideration.

"On the whole, therefore, considering the circumstances I have alluded to above, I think the Province has reason to be thankful that immediate and urgent needs, such as our financial position would allow, have been satisfactorily made in this the first Budget of Your Honour's administration."

✓ The Hon'ble Mr. DAS said:—"Your Honour, on a previous occasion when I represented Orissa, from my seat in this Chamber I said that a non-official Member of this Council was an interpreter between the Government and the people. On that occasion my interpretation of a non-official Member's position was endorsed by our illustrious countryman who now is an Hon'ble Judge of the High Court—the Hon'ble Justice Ashutosh Mukherjee. My duties are to bring to the notice of Government the views and the feelings of the people and to explain to the people of Orissa the reasons which influence Government in their action, the object Government have in adopting particular measures, and how such measures are calculated to affect the interests of the people.

"My personal views and opinions I should not allow to ride over those of the millions whom the Budget affects. I read the budget as the people of Orissa would read it."

"Looking at the allotments in the budget under the several sub-heads of education, a disparity in the distribution of the funds is visible. The people were hitherto under an impression that Orissa was left in the cold because her claims had not been eloquently advanced. That of the three children, Bengal,

[*Mr. Das.*]

Bihar and Orissa, the most eloquent commanded the attention of the paternal Government. But Your Honour's salutary advice given at the last sitting of the Council with regard to speeches in Council is calculated to remove that impression, and we have reason to hope that whatever reasons might have guided the Bengal Government in the past in the allotment of funds to advance education in the three provinces under that Government the 'most eloquent and the most clamorous should be first attended to' (which is the rule some parents go by) will not be the rule of Your Honour's Government.

"In Bengal the people appreciate the advantage of high education. High education has been a long-standing plant in Bengal; it has struck a root in the province; it has borne fruits. The private colleges testify to the appreciation of the benefits of high education by the people. Colleges have been run on commercial lines. They are in some cases a source of income to the proprietors.

"Add to this the fact that the permanent settlement has raised a rich aristocracy. The condition of the people is more prosperous. Of the three provinces under this Government, Orissa has been under British rule during the shortest period. She is the youngest and the poorest child, yet Orissa has made progressive contributions to income under Land-revenue. The people of Orissa think that their claims ought to have preferential attention. But the Budget allotments point the other way.

"I find in the Budget under discussion an allotment for Law classes at Bankipore but none for Orissa. I hold in my hand a letter which contains a promise for Law classes in Orissa should the number of students be sufficient. We are thankful to Government for having awarded six scholarships to students from Orissa who come to Calcutta to read Law, but that has already been found insufficient. I know that already ten applications have been made and by the time the result of the B. A. Examination now being held will be published there will be fully another ten applications.

"The number of students in a class is not a proper test of the appreciation of education among a people in the early stage of a foreign education. B. L. candidates from Orissa have in past years distinguished themselves in the University. One year a student of the Cuttack Law classes stood at the top of the successful B. L. candidates.

"The principle which ought to guide the Government in giving backward Orissa facilities for education ought to be sought in the budget allotments of Bengal during the few years which followed the first introduction of law as a subject of study in Bengal.

"There is another test by which to judge whether people appreciate high education or not. This is the contribution by the people towards this object.

"There are some colleges in Bengal where Government scholarships are given in recognition of private donation towards the funds of the college. An inquiry will disclose facts in support of this statement. The Government College at Cuttack and the hostel attached to it has received private donations to the extent of nearly Rs. 38,000. This is not in any way discreditable to a poor province. But there has been no recognition by Government of this private liberality as in Bengal. The College at present is inadequately equipped, the details of which are given below :—

Wants of the College.

I. Affiliation :—

- (a) In History for Intermediate and B
- (b) In Physics for B. A. or B. Sc.
- (c) In Botany for B. A. or B. Sc.

II. Strengthening the staff—

- (a) A Lecturer-demonstrator for Chemistry (Immediate).
- (b) A third Lecturer for English (Immediate).
- (c) Two Professors for History.
- (d) A Lecturer-demonstrator for Physics.
- (e) A Lecturer-demonstrator for Botany.

[Mr. Das.]

III. Building accommodation—

- (a) Eight or nine rooms for the Arts classes, of which two should be at least 40' x 25'.
- (b) Rooms for Library, Reading room, Students' common room, etc.
- (c) Examination Hall.

IV. Special grants for the—

- (a) Library.
- (b) Chemical, Physical and Botanical Laboratories.
- (c) Water-supply for the Laboratory.

V. Playground.

“The Cuttack Collegiate School is the only one under Your Honour's Government which counts among its students ruling Chiefs. The Maharaja of Moubhanj was educated there. The importance of education of these Chiefs who are destined to rule over large populations cannot be over-estimated from a political point of view.

“Besides the Cuttack College counts among its students many Bengalis who accompany their guardians who are transferred on public service or who are drawn there by considerations of cheap living and healthy climate. Every one who had something to do with the students of the Cuttack College will support me in my statement that in the case of Bengali students the cause of discipline, the interests of good manners have not suffered, if not gained, by their education out of Bengal, and the interests of the British Empire in raising up loyal subjects among the educated class have not suffered.

“On a consideration of the advantages which Bengali students get by attending the College at Cuttack, I hope my appeal to Your Honour on behalf of that College will receive the support of the Hon'ble Members who represent Bengal proper.

“For some time past the people of Orissa have been promised an Engineering School. This was promised on condition that the people contribute Rs. 20,000 towards the initial cost. I remember having visited suitable sites in the company of a former Lieutenant-Governor and of a Director of Public Instruction, now retired. Only a few weeks ago I was asked by the Commissioner whether I was willing to raise twenty thousand rupees as I had promised. I moved in the matter and I got promises from friends. But I do not see any allotment for it in the Budget before us.

“Under the head of Female education I find provision for training schools for female teachers at Bankipore and Calcutta, but no provision for Orissa. Female education has as good prospects in Orissa as it has in any other part of the country under Your Honour's Government. The absence of early marriage among the higher classes is not an insignificant factor in judging of the prospects of female education. It is true that female education in Orissa has not made the same progress that it has done in Bengal, but no attempt has been made on proper lines. Female education is a delicate subject and a most difficult matter to deal with. There is no subject which imposes on Government officials greater obligation of consulting the feelings of the people.

“Rules made for grants-in-aid to boys' schools ought to be modified. The powers of Magistrates who never visit a girls' school, never give a moment's thought to the subject of female education, to interfere with its management merely for love of interference ought to be curtailed. The management ought to be left in the hands of the people who support a school or send their daughters to the school and not to European Magistrates who delight in disturbing harmonious working on grounds unintelligible to the non-official public, and therefore apt to be misconstrued.

“The last census figures show that the percentage of literate population among females in Orissa is double that of Bihar.

“Government sent to England a Bengali lady to study the system of female education in England. She studied as a Government scholar. Orissa sent a lady the costs of whose education were paid from private resources. Since this lady's return from England a girls' school has been taken in hand. The Director of Public Instruction calls it ‘the first really successful effort in the way of Uriya female education.’ But to make female education successful

[*Mr. Das.*]

in Orissa we must have trained female teachers. The teachers must be trained in the vernacular of the Province. I do not know what rule Government goes by in providing for training female teachers in Bihar and Bengal and disregarding the claims of Orissa. If the extent of public contribution is the test, I feel sure the people of Orissa will not lag behind Bihar in that matter, but no opportunity has been given to them. My hopes of public liberality in this matter are based on the liberal support which the girls' school referred to above received at the hands of the Orissa public—the public having subscribed about nine thousand rupees towards the funds of the school in one year.

"I am not in favour of mendicancy, and I shall be the last person to teach it to my people. I believe in the old saying, 'Heaven helps those who help themselves,' and I hope Government appreciates the principle underlying this old saying.

"The Medical School at Cuttack, from the date of its foundation has received support of public liberality. The latest donation was a sum of rupees twenty-five thousand towards the construction of a female ward. The School is attended by a large number of Bengali boys, and therefore any grant towards the better equipment of this School will not be an advantage to Orissa exclusively. I am thankful to Your Honour's Government for the provision of scholarships for Uriya students and for a grant of Rs. 3,000 when Your Honour visited the School.

"The Budget does not represent a state of financial prosperity, and therefore, my demands in the interests of education might not meet with Government approval, but, as I said at the commencement, I am here to lay before Your Honour the views and feelings of the people of Orissa.

"*Revision of Land-settlement.*—There is a large allotment for maintenance of land records and revision of settlement.

"It would be irrelevant to enlarge here on the unpopularity of the revision of settlement work. There is a marked difference of opinion between the people and the Government on the utility of the measure. Any one anxious to ascertain which view is correct may do so by visiting without previous notice a settlement camp as a distinguished English Journalist did. He visited some camps at 11 o'clock at night, saw the people and ascertained their views.

"It is admitted that the main object of this measure is to reduce the costs of the next revenue settlement of Orissa which comes about twenty years hence. The Hon'ble Member in his explanatory remarks said that 'Government has been advised that this is a work of much urgency and that it will be much more economical to push it through rapidly than spread it over a considerable number of years.' Revenue settlement work means an increase of Revenue. The enhanced assessment of each settlement means so much contribution from people's income to the Government exchequer. The people of Orissa make this contribution. Bengal is free from this liability.

"If the Government can afford to provide large sums for different branches of education in Bengal, notwithstanding that it has to make large provisions for unforeseen anarchism and sedition, I hope the request of the people of Orissa will not be considered unreasonable if they ask that the revision of settlement work might be spread over a few years so as to enable Government to make provision for education in the present budget with only a portion of the large amount allotted for the work.

"The reasons for the urgency of the measure are unknown to the people. The protection of the rights of the poor raiyats from the encroachment of oppressive zamindars cannot be any of those reasons; for we know that records-of-rights were made about ten years ago in Orissa, whereas in most parts of Bengal proper there has never been any record-of-rights. The records of Courts of law if examined will show that the relation between zamindars and raiyats in Bengal is more unfriendly than in Orissa. Under these circumstances is it any wonder if the people fail to see the justice of the provisions for education in Orissa in the present budget.

"There is a provision of Rs. 59,000 for 'Maintenance of records-of-rights in Orissa.' The work that is being done now is in the nature of an experiment. This experiment is expected to suggest the lines on which legislation is to be made for maintenance of records-of-rights.

[Mr. Das.]

“It is difficult for the people to understand why Orissa should have been selected as the field of experiment. Bengal, where the people are more advanced, better acquainted with the nature of their rights and better able to defend and define those rights, would have been a more suitable field for experiment. Experiment to be useful as guidance for the evolution of a scheme should not be made in a tract where the people are ignorant. Besides, what is the legal value of records made without the sanction of law? Moreover, it is in contemplation to re-cast the scattered legislative enactments now constituting the land-law of Orissa and pass a consolidated Act defining the legal incidents of the several kinds of interest in land in Orissa. There was a Conference the other day on this subject. This change has been found necessary because the land-law of Bengal does not suit the conditions of Orissa. A change in the near future is before us. With this prospect of a change in the law, is it economical to hurry on the revision of records under a law which Government have found necessary to alter? What would be the value of these records if the contemplated Act is passed? Either the law will remain a deadletter or the records must be altered to comply with the new law.

“If twenty years hence the people are expected to contribute a portion of their income to the Government revenue, is it unjust and inequitable of the people to expect that a portion of the present revenue should be spent in providing education on lines which are calculated to compensate for the loss ahead? Is it fair and just that education should be postponed in order that saving might be made in the preparatory measures for the next revenue settlement? These are questions which naturally suggest themselves to the people. All I expect is that explanations on these points should be given if the Government do not see their way to transfer a portion of the amount allotted for these purposes for educational purposes.

“It is wise to feed the goose which lays golden eggs. Every schoolboy knows it is unwise to kill it: it is equally unwise to stint its growth. The shepherd who invests in shearing tools all his funds and in the meantime neglects the well-being of his sheep will not win the reputation of a wise shepherd. If the maintenance of records-of-rights in lands is necessary, have it by all means. But there is another record and a more valuable one. The temple of Bhubaneswar, Puri and Kanaruk testify to the capabilities of the people prior to the days of British rule. The maintenance of this record is more valuable. A few thousand rupees spent on repairs to these edifices might preserve the handiwork, but the intellect which designed them and the hand which executed the design have disappeared. These monuments of past glory serve only the purpose of weeping willows under which the present generation might weep over their loss. The people of Orissa have a history worthy of any people in India. They have a glorious future in their unexploited natural resources. But these treasures lie concealed in the dark cells of ignorance. Let the light of education shine on those dark places. I hope Your Honour's name, which has been associated with progress in Bengal, will also be associated with progress in Orissa, and whatever value posterity might attach to record of land, it will be Your Honour's share to have maintained the records of a people's intellect.

“*Increase of Salary of Advocate-General.*—The budget provides for an increase to the salary of the Advocate-General. The present pay was found sufficient to secure the services of illustrious lawyers like the late Sir Charles Paul, Mr. Woodroffe and the Hon'ble Mr. S. P. Sinha. I have no doubt that there is reason for this increase of pay, but I hope it is not the intention of Government, as rumour has it, to bring out a lawyer from England for the post. We know that in Madras a Vakil was appointed to the post. It would be placing an undeserved discount on the erudition and experience of the Barristers and Vakils in Calcutta if the office were filled up by a gentleman from England.

“*Fisheries.*—A large sum has been set apart for Fisheries inquiries. It appears from the remarks of the Hon'ble Member who introduced the budget that it is in the contemplation of Government to leave the industry ultimately to private enterprise. If that is the object, it is desirable to avoid all measures which are likely to be misconstrued as attempts on the part of Government to turn it to an additional source of revenue to the prejudice of private rights.

[Mr. Das.]

“I don't know how the action of Government has been construed in Bengal, but there have been acts by Government officials in Orissa which have been construed as attempts to encroach upon long-enjoyed rights of fishery over natural waters.

“I find a provision for scholarship for the study of pisciculture in Europe and America. The study of an industry in a foreign country is useful to the country, if the student on his return to India finds employment under private employers. Capital is shy of enterprise in this country. Government sent out students who returned as expert agriculturists but spent their time in presiding over Law Courts. It is far more economical to subsidize private enterprise in these matters. It ensures employment to the student on his return as an expert and Government has the satisfaction of developing a new industry at a small cost. There are estates with considerable fishery industry in Orissa. The owner of one estate was thinking of improving this industry. Gentlemen of this type ought to be induced to help Government in this matter. This procedure will ensure public confidence in the intention of Government, ensure employment to the student on his return to India and facilitate the dissemination of new information on the subject among the people.

“At page 14 of the budget the allotment under the head of Civil Works shows an increase in the cost of Establishment, whereas there is a decrease in the cost of Original Works and Repairs. The total cost of Original Works and Repairs in 1907-08 was Rs. 61,33,592. The revised estimate of 1908-09 gives the figures at Rs. 50,14,000 and the estimate for 1909-10 is Rs. 33,13,000. The cost of establishment during these years is Rs. 9,59,300, Rs. 10,20,000 and Rs. 11,61,406, respectively. Is the rise due solely to annual increments in the salary of the establishments?

“The note in the remarks column in page 29 of the budget shows that District Boards did not appropriate grants for primary schools. If this was due to the inability of the people to comply with the terms of the grant, it is desirable that the terms should be modified so as to suit the conditions of each district in consultation with local officials of the Education Department.

“*Famine Relief.*—Famines cannot be altogether prevented, because man cannot control the clouds. The rigour of famine distress is felt by the population dependent on agriculture. The population of this class is very large. I believe about 85 per cent. of the population are dependent on their subsistence upon the produce of the land. This means that by far the major portion of the population depends for their means of subsistence on the uncertain mercies of the clouds above.

“The average cultivator is but a day-labourer. The area of his holding is barely sufficient in years of good crops to keep him alive. He has no capital. He is a labourer with this disadvantage against him, that while the labourer who works for another gets his wages every day, the cultivator has to wait till the harvest for his wages; and when the harvest fails he loses his wages for the whole period of his labour.

“This is exactly the relative position of the two classes. It is a mistake to suppose that the average raiyat's condition is better than that of the day-labourer. It is desirable to relieve the pressure on land; to draft a portion of the cultivating classes to other pursuits of life which ensure a certain income. The development of industries is the only means of affecting this. In industry the burden of the loss, if there is any, is thrown on the capitalist; the workmen are sure of their wages.

“Famines afford a favourable opportunity for drafting a portion of the cultivator class to other pursuits of life. In ordinary times the cultivator will not change his occupation. His ideas of caste system and his conservative turn of mind are against any change. But in times of adversity, these barriers to changes lose their strength. In times of famine even the conservatism of caste in matters of food is relaxed.

“Famine-relief labour is sometimes employed in works which are not in demand, whose utility is either doubtful or disproportionate to the money spent on it.

“My humble suggestion is that a portion of the famine-relief fund should be appropriated to teach people who depend on cultivation some handicraft

[*Mr. Das ; Babu Radha Charan Pal.*]

which will secure to them a certain income as skilled labourers. It will require great tact on the part of those entrusted with the duty to induce the people to such a change, but I have no doubt tact and persuasion will succeed. The success might not be very encouraging at first; but the better condition of a few who adopt the change will be a powerful motive with their neighbours to follow their example.

"If the Government be disposed to adopt the principle and consider it worth their while to have my humble views on the details of the scheme, I shall not only be glad to discuss the details with officials appointed for the work."

The Hon'ble BABU RADHA CHARAN PAL said:—"Your Honour, I must confess that I rise to speak on this occasion with some amount of trepidation. Your Honour's observations on the occasion of the introduction of the Budget are to us both a warning and a signal. I may venture to point out that under the existing system this is the only occasion when the non-official members of your Honour's Council have an opportunity of placing directly before the Head of the Government matters of general administration which deeply concern the people of the province. The proceedings of the Council, as now conducted, afford no scope to members to criticise any especial feature of the administration or to suggest modification in the light of popular views and, so far as this Council is concerned, Government would not only be kept ignorant of the currents which flow through the stream of Indian life but would miss an opportunity of explaining its policy, removing misapprehensions and of answering criticisms—an object which the Imperial Parliament had in view on the occasion of the passing of the Indian Councils Act of 1892. Both the Imperial and Provincial Governments have therefore allowed the requisite latitude of debate on the discussion of the Budget, and on the whole the debate has been more helpful than otherwise.

"If the discussion to-day were to be confined strictly to the Budget I should respectfully invite Your Honour's attention to the fact that the Budget is laid before the Council cut and dry, after it has been sanctioned by the Government of India, and it leaves no room for alteration of grants and no scope for real and useful criticism, inasmuch as all schemes and proposals involving new expenditure are first of all sanctioned and then included in the Budget. To promote useful discussions on the Budget itself, it is necessary that a monthly statement of the progress of expenditure and revenues by minor heads with explanation of increase and decrease under each head as well as an Appropriation Report should be prepared and circulated to the members and they should have an opportunity of scrutinising various proposals for increased expenditure in the light of public utility before inclusion in the Budget. I venture to hope that regulations under the new Council Bill when passed will provide for real and useful discussion of important public questions and greater control over the finances of the country. The time of the Council will not be taken up to discuss the policy of the Administration on the Budget day.

"When the Budget estimate was placed last year before the Council, it was expected to close with a balance of Rs. 13,90,000, which was reduced on revision to Rs. 8,77,900. Not only does this balance disappear in the current Budget, but it shows a deficit of nearly 17 lakhs, which is made good by a corresponding Imperial contribution to secure financial equilibrium. The estimate of receipts under certain heads appears to be rather optimistic; for instance under Stamps the total increase during the last five years commencing from 1904-05 has been 22 lakhs, giving an average increase of about 4½ lakhs a year. The increase of 8 lakhs in 1909-10 over the preceding year seems therefore to be too high. Similarly under Excise the estimate of last year was 175 lakhs, compared with the actual of 171 lakhs of the preceding year. In the revised estimate of the last year, it was reduced to 172 lakhs; but the Budget estimate of the current year is placed as 179 lakhs. This heavy increase of 7 lakhs in the year following one of distress and scarcity seems to be abnormal. Even these optimistic estimates are quite inadequate to keep pace with the growing and insistent demands of the

[*Babu Rudha Charan Pal.*]

province, which cannot, I am afraid, be met without substantial Imperial contribution. The public is grateful to Your Honour for the forcible representation made to the Supreme Government on the subject in your last Budget speech.

“The Corporation of Calcutta is deeply grateful to Government for the spontaneous offer to meet the cost of Government audit of Municipal accounts and the contribution to meet the increased cost of fringe-area drainage necessitated by the obstruction to the natural outfall of the city by Circular Canal. I am grateful to Government for making a representation to the Government of India for the investment of the 50 lakhs held in trust for the City Improvement Scheme, as suggested by some non-official Members including the representatives of the Chamber of Commerce and the Trades Association and I regret the Government did not sanction it. I believe I am correct in saying that the money is employed in loan works and that it has reduced the Government loan to that extent. May I hope that $3\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. interest be credited to this Fund for the use of the Trust money.

“*Salary of Ministerial Officers.*—I find that the provision for increase of pay of ministerial officers is repeated in this year's Budget. I understand that the scheme has been partially given effect to in anticipation of the orders of the Government of India. The public would be glad to know whether the scale of salaries has been so revised, with special reference to the high and increasing cost of living, as to give substantial relief to a useful and hard-working body of underpaid officers. I venture to express the hope that there will be no longer any delay in giving complete effect to the scheme, and that the Budget provision will be fully utilised during the year.

“*Probationary Deputy and Sub-Deputy Collectors and Assistant Surgeons.*—A provision of Rs. 59,000 has been made for Additional Deputy Collectors for settlement duty. But there is a large and deserving class of Probationary Deputy and Sub-Deputy Collectors, who, I understand, have been in the probationary grade for more than a year, drawing only half the pay of their lowest grades. Probationary officers used formerly to be made sub. *pro tem.* in the lowest grade of the service after six months. The indefinite prolongation of the probationary period has been a source of great hardship, and I venture to express the hope that the provision of Rs. 50,000 will be so utilised as to remove the complaint.

“Our grateful thanks are due to Government for the provision for improving the pay and prospects of Civil Hospital Assistants. In this connection may I inquire whether the Government have come to any decision regarding the pay and prospects of that highly deserving class of public servants—the Civil Hospital Assistant Surgeons, whose petition has been under consideration of Government for more than a year, and to whose grievances I drew the attention of Government last year.

“*Separation of Judicial and Executive functions.*—It was about this time last year that the public were led to expect the introduction of the scheme of the separation of Executive and Judicial functions within the next twelve months. The year has rolled away and we do not find any provision in the present Budget to give effect to the scheme, which, it seems evident, is yet a long way off; and the expectations raised last year are giving place to disappointment. On behalf of my countrymen, I appeal to Your Honour to expedite the introduction of this much-needed reform.

“*Court-fees.*—Last year, I drew the attention of the Government to the anomaly in the imposition of court-fees prevailing in the two Courts of Small Causes, situated on either side of the Circular Road, the fee charged in the one case being 11 per cent., while in the other it is only $7\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. on the amount sued. The Hon'ble Mr. Streatfeild stated on behalf of the Government that the matter was receiving consideration and some relief was hoped for. So far as I can gather this anomaly has not yet been removed. May I inquire whether the matter has arrived at the final stage for decision?

“I desire to avail myself of this opportunity to thank Government on behalf of the rate-payers of Calcutta for reducing the cost of appeals in municipal assessments. I prayed on behalf of the Corporation for the total abolition of

[Babu Radha Charan Pal.]

the court-fees in Municipal assessment cases, which was in harmony with the practice which prevailed before 1901, but the Government does not propose to finally decide the matter until they have watched the effect of the reduction. I hope that the matter will not be lost sight of.

"*Public Works Department.*—A very large sum of money is annually spent through the agency of Public Works Department, and there seems to be a public impression that there is need for greater scrutiny and control over the expenditure with a view to prevent any possible waste or extravagance. I am sure the Government is alive to this. In this year's Budget I find about 33 lakhs have been provided for original and repair work and nearly 11½ lakhs for establishment. A provision of one-third of the sum allotted to original construction and repairs to meet the cost of establishment charges seems to be too high. I wish it could have been reduced.

"*Police Court.*—Last year I brought to the notice of Government the miserable condition of the Calcutta Police Court Building, consisting of dingy, dark and ill-ventilated rooms, unfit for use as public court rooms; and I suggested that an extension of the building was urgently required. In reply to my suggestion the Hon'ble Mr. Gait said that the estimate of 45 lakhs which had been submitted was too high, and that he could not possibly consider it unless it was reduced to a reasonable figure.

"I quite agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Gait that the estimate of 45 lakhs was out of all proportion to the requirements of the case; but I understand that it included both the police-station and the Police Court. I think the two should be separated. I fail to understand why another storey cannot be erected on the top of the existing building, which, I believe, is not more than 20 years old. The Police Court has no library of reference, and it should be provided with one as soon as possible.

"Since 1904-05 there has been a steady increase in the cost of the Calcutta Police Court, with the exception of a small saving of Rs. 9,000 this year due to change of officers. Formerly, there were only two stipendiary Magistrates, but within the last few years no less than two Magistrates have been added. This increase of expenditure would not have been necessary if the Honorary Presidency Magistrates had been entrusted, as in the past, with the disposal of a larger number of cases. The following figures show how the Honorary Magistrates have been slowly but surely deprived of their privileges:—

	1904.	1905.	1906.	1907.
Stipendiary Magistrates ...	24,936	24,037	28,648	28,436
Honorary Magistrates ...	2,067	1,465	1,320	1,363
Total ...	27,003	25,502	29,968	29,799
Percentage of cases disposed of by Honorary Magistrates on total ...	7.7	5.8	4.4	4.6

"The Honorary Presidency Magistrates belong to a highly respectable and educated section of the community, both European and Indian, many of them being its honoured leaders. They have discharged their duties with credit to themselves and have earned the approbation of Government. It implies a reflection upon them, if any action on the part of the Government tends to differentiate their position and capacity from those of the Deputy Magistrates.

"*Courts of Law.*—A suggestion was made by me last year for the institution of Honorary Benches in the Small Cause Courts for the disposal of petty Civil suits. But the Hon'ble Mr. Streatfeild stated that the Government was not prepared at that time to express an opinion. I understand that this system is in vogue in some provinces of India and it may be introduced with advantage into Bengal. May I inquire whether the matter has since received the attention of Government and whether any definite pronouncement can shortly be expected?

"The cost of Law Courts has increased by about 9½ lakhs since 1904-05. But I am sorry to say that the facilities to obtain justice are by no means commensurate with the increase of cost. It not infrequently happens that a poor suitor finds it difficult to move the subordinates of the Court without

[Babu Radha Charan Pal.]

being subjected to harassment and illegal exactions. This is a growing evil and calls for an early remedy.

"*Education.*—I observe with satisfaction that there has been a steady increase in the educational grant within the last few years, and though it now stands at 55½ lakhs of rupees, it is hardly adequate to meet the educational requirements of the country. The Director of Public Instruction in his last report lamented that, having reached a stage of educational advancement, it became necessary for want of funds to cry a sudden halt. This state of things is greatly to be deplored, and I hope that Your Honour's Government will before long be in a position to make an advance along the path of progress chalked out by the Director. Looking at the figures in the Budget I am struck with the disproportionate expenditure on inspection of schools compared with that on management. While the expenditure on primary and secondary education has increased from Rs. 4,85,000 to Rs. 7,44,000, that is, by 53 per cent., the cost of their inspection has increased from Rs. 2,49,000 to Rs. 7,17,000, that is, nearly three-fold. I hope, as funds permit, this disparity will be set right by the grant of larger funds to be spent on schools.

"I regret that a sum of not more than Rs. 61,000 could be allotted for Technical and Industrial schools. This meagre provision is not worthy of this great Province over which Your Honour rules.

"For years past Hon'ble Members in this Council have been asking for larger and larger funds for the development of Technical and Industrial education, and the whole country expects that the Government should give it a fair start. A great and laudable step was taken by Government in deputing the Hon'ble Mr. Cumming to make a survey of the industrial position and prospects in Bengal. The task was completed in a thorough and masterly manner, and in a spirit of sympathy with our needs and aspirations. But I am sorry to say that while Madras has already got a department of industries and the scheme formulated by Sir John Hewett is complete and awaiting the sanction of the Secretary of State, no provision has been made in our Budget to make a beginning for carrying out Mr. Cumming's recommendations.

"I find that a sum of 5 lakhs has been provided for experimental cultivation, which includes Rs. 75,000 for fittings and appliances of the Sabour Agricultural College. It would be interesting to know what actual expenditure is included in this sum for purely demonstration and experimental work. Agriculture is the most important industry in India, supporting nearly 70 per cent. of the people. The bulk of the Indian agriculturists are poor and illiterate, to whom a scientific and technical system of teaching imparted at a single place such as Sabour would not be of much use. What is required is simple and practical lessons in agriculture brought to their doors. For this purpose there should be a large number of travelling instructors who should travel from village to village, teaching the cultivators improved methods of agriculture, distributing select and improved varieties of seeds, teaching the use of manures and selling them at popular prices, organising exhibitions, demonstrating the use of improved agricultural implements, and rendering such assistance to the cultivators as would help to develop their industry. In short, it is necessary to have men trained in the simple principles and practice of agriculture, who will gladly come into contact with the people, and whose pay and prospects must be sufficiently attractive for zealous and efficient work.

"*Inspection of factories—Septic tanks.*—It is necessary to know what sum out of Rs. 50,000 allotted under the head 'Inspector of Factories' represents the cost of inspection of septic tank installations. The contamination of the water of the Hooghly by what is popularly known as liquid sewage is an outrage to the religious sentiments of the Hindu population of the riparian tracts. Since the effluents have been discharged into the Hooghly the health of the population of these tracts has suffered. The Hooghly is the only source of drinking-water supply, not only to the ten millions of the people of Calcutta, but also to the millions inhabiting both sides of the river. Many eminent medical men have expressed great doubts as to the purity of the effluents even after they have been sterilised and filtrated. For instance, Dr. Harrison of Lincoln said:—'A river receiving drainage and effluents from a large town could not with any degree of safety be used for domestic purposes. It is unwise and

[Babu Radha Charan Pal.]

dangerous to take water from a source known to be polluted and liable to pollution, and trust to the purifying effects of filtration to render it safe for consumption.' Dr. Cook, the late Health Officer of Calcutta, raised his voice against the contamination of the source of water-supply of this city. The Sanitary Commissioner of Bengal in his report says that the bacteriological examination of several samples of effluents disclosed that they were not absolutely pure. I submit it is the duty of the Government, out of deference to the religious susceptibilities of the people no less than to the interests of sanitation, to prevent the discharge into the sacred waters of the Hooghly, and to devise some means of disposing of the matter either by burning it or by utilising it as manure, or in any other feasible way.

" *Anti-malarial measures.*—A sum of Rs. 10,000 has been provided for anti-malarial measures, which, I presume, arise out of the report of the Drainage Committee appointed by Government in 1906. It will be remembered that the Committee suggested systematic investigation and continuous research in small areas during fever seasons. The inquiry suggested had already been instituted, and I hope the result will be made public at an early date. I may be permitted to state that whatever may be the different causes of malaria, it has been established beyond doubt by the investigation of the Committee that the conditions most favourable to the generation of malaria, are defective drainage, bad drinking supply and the existence of thick jungles and a large number of insanitary tanks and pits impervious to the influence of the sun. In this connection the Committee recommended the creation of a special Engineering Division to prepare projects for the improvement of the drainage conditions of specified areas, where necessary. The public would like to know whether such a division has been created and what steps, if any, have been taken to remove the malarial conditions of our villages. A special grant of 4½ lakhs was generously granted by the Government of India for sanitary improvements last year and renewed for the current year. It is not clear from the Financial Statement whether the money was spent for the purpose for which it was especially intended; and whether the whole or any portion of it will be spent during the current year on the above objects.

" *Health Resorts.*—It is not clear from the Budget what sum was spent for improvement work in Frasergunge last year and what is proposed to be spent this year. From the Bengal Administration Report it appears that up to the end of 1907-08, a sum of Rs. 4,55,000 has been spent, and I believe the sum is considerably more if totalled up to date. A vast sum of money has been spent in Frasergunge at a time when the financial condition of the Province was not favourable and the prospect seemed to be far from cheering. Cholera and malaria are not absent from the place, and applications for building sites from European gentlemen have been withdrawn on account of uncertainty of steamer service and their unwillingness to spend the sums fixed by the Board of Revenue for construction of houses. I do not know whether the money spent on this island will be reproductive. Last year, and the year before last, I appealed for the improvement of Diamond Harbour. The Hon'ble Mr. Collin informed the Council that a scheme for the construction of a dâk bungalow was shortly to be carried out. As yet nothing has been done to carry out the scheme. Diamond Harbour is an excellent place, close to Calcutta, exposed to sea-breezes, free from malaria, and is an excellent place for a sanitarium. When the Magrahat drainage scheme is completed and steps taken to fill up the *dobas* on the sides of the embankments, it will be an idea place for the establishment of a sanitarium, which the Maharajadhiraja of Burdwan has in view.

" *Anarchy and sedition.*—In the year of stress and strain it is a matter of supreme regret to us that anarchy and sedition have cost us nearly seven lakhs last year. That abominable crimes should darken the fair fame of our province, that boys and young men should forget the dictates of humanity and the precepts of religion, is to us a matter of deep and lasting regret and shame. I hope we have turned a corner and that the abnormal expenditure of last year will not be incurred again. But while I express my detestation and abhorrence of these crimes, I should be failing in my duty if I did not submit to Your Honour the prayer of the nation that the over-zealousness of the police

[Babu Radha Charan Pal; Mr. Larmour.]

resulting in such lamentable consequences of irritation and ill-feeling and even of oppression and waste of public money, as in the Midnapore case, should be suppressed. While on this subject, on behalf of my countrymen, I crave leave to submit that the gentlemen of our province, now unhappily in detention under an ancient regulation have been known to have lived an unblemished life, and one of them, Babu Kristo Kumar Mitra, the great and venerated Brahma leader, has been the stern reprover of all outrages, and the prominent advocate of constitutional methods in the discussion of public questions. The deportation of men like him has created a painful impression. The Government must have got some materials upon which they acted, but they are all *ex parte*. My countrymen hope that these materials will be examined by the light of public opinion and that their detention will not be prolonged further on mere *ex parte* and unproved statements.

"I pray Your Honour will take into consideration the case of the two British subjects, who have been living in the territories under Your Honour's sway and make a recommendation for their release, and thereby emphasise the generosity and liberality of the Government in offering concession and conciliation to the subjects of the King-Emperor.

"*Reform scheme.*—Sir, this is the last time that the Budget is discussed in the old Council and under the old regulations. We stand at the threshold of a great constitutional reform which the country has welcomed with gratitude and enthusiasm. The Reform Scheme as originally formulated will stand forth as a great landmark in the history of our progress. If Lord Minto and Lord Morley have been the originators of the scheme, to you, Sir, will belong the unique honour of introducing it and of working it in the most advanced province of the Indian Empire. We in Bengal rejoice that it should be so, for we have keenly watched your career as a member of the Government of India and we have not failed to observe that Your Honour has taken a prominent part in the formulation of the scheme. You have already, with that prescience which characterises true statesmanship, sounded the note of change which ought to pervade the temper and attitude of the great and historic service to which you belong. As you rightly said 'the spirit of autocracy must give place to the arts of suasion and conciliation in the government of this great province.' Many have been the distinguished members of the service who consecrated their lives for the welfare of the great dependency of the British Empire and it is not too much to expect a chivalrous and large-hearted response from that glorious service. During the short period Sir, for which you have held the helm of affairs, you have given us abundant reasons to hope that the scheme will be worked with sympathy and liberality. May I venture to express the earnest hope that the spirit of conciliation and sympathy which distinguishes Your Honour and His Excellency the Viceroy and the Secretary of State will leaven the temper and attitude of the great official hierarchy, so that in all their dealings they will remember that the Indians, in the expressive words of Lord Morley, are 'the King's equal subjects.'

"*Mr. Sinha's appointment.*—Before I sit down, I cannot refrain from alluding to the appointment of our honourable and distinguished colleague, Mr. Sinha to the high position of Law Member of His Excellency the Viceroy's Council. It is an unique honour, which has evoked a universal chorus of gratitude to His Excellency the Viceroy and to that venerable and broad-hearted statesman at the helm of Indian affairs, who has so steadfastly stood by His Excellency the Viceroy in the period of transition of India. We rejoice that our Magna Charta, the gracious proclamation of our late beloved Queen Victoria the Good, that no subject of the British Crown will be debarred by reason of his race, colour and creed, from holding any high office of trust and responsibility—is vindicated and I beg leave to avail myself of this occasion to offer through you Honour the Nation's most heart-felt and most grateful thanks to His Majesty's Government."

The Hon'ble MR. LARMOUR said:—"Your Honour, I share with others the regret we feel that we are not able to congratulate the Government on a Prosperity Budget. I recognize also the fact that the time is inopportune to ask special favours when every rupee has to be carefully scrutinised before it is spent, and that only what is actually necessary can be provided for in the coming year, and I do most earnestly re-echo the hope expressed by the

[*Mr. Larmour.*]

Hon'ble Member in charge of the Budget that the troubles we are passing through may be only of a transitory nature, leading in the near future to the possibility of a Budget which shall be more satisfactory, in every respect, to all those who have the best interests of this great province of the Empire sincerely at heart.

“Naturally, Sir, the subject in which we, permanent dwellers in Calcutta, are keenly interested in is the long-looked for Improvement Scheme. To us, who are not behind the scenes, hope was beginning to turn into despair, and it seemed to us that the great project had been indefinitely put on the shelf, but now a faint glimmer of hopeful expectation has arisen from the information conveyed to us by a high authority in another place that the Bill which is to be eventually introduced in this Council is now having the careful attention of the Supreme Council, though our hopes are not unmingled with dismay when we learn that the Bill will contain no less than one hundred and ninety-one clauses. I fear, Sir, that few of us will survive the discussion of such a Bill, and that it will be the privilege of those who come after us to see it become law and to enjoy the blessings of a renovated Calcutta.

“In that new Calcutta and with the advantage of long years of previous experience, I have no doubt that the authority in whose hands it will then rest to regulate such affairs, ample facilities will be afforded and provision made to fight disease in all its forms and to aid the stricken. But for us of the present day the question is of the utmost importance, and it cannot be denied that in the Calcutta of to-day we are not sufficiently prepared or equipped to meet the extraordinary demands which arise from sudden outbreaks of virulent and fatal epidemics. We note with gratitude that liberal grants have been made for Hospitals and Medical work generally, but the test as to the sufficiency of those grants in special cases comes when we are brought face to face with such an epidemic of small-pox as is now raging so violently in Calcutta and claiming so many victims daily. I trust, Sir, I may be pardoned if I take up the time of the Council by referring to this subject which is of the very greatest importance to the community at large, and which I do not approach from any hostile spirit or desire to cavil at what has been done, and done in the face of enormous difficulties. Until very lately the only institution in Calcutta where small-pox patients could be received was the Campbell Hospital. In that Hospital there are, I understand, four hundred and eighty beds. Of these, less than eighty are set apart for small-pox patients, and the resources of the Hospital were strained to their utmost extent. By doubling up two paying patients in one room and by erecting temporary sheds, as many as two hundred patients have been received at one time, but large numbers have had to be refused admission owing to there being no space available for them. Too much cannot be said in praise of the devotion of the Medical and Nursing Staff in their endeavours to alleviate the sufferings of those who have been stricken down by this, the most loathsome disease known to humanity, but their efforts must of necessity be limited, and it is horrible to think of the numbers who have had to suffer and die for want of proper and adequate means of treatment. I plead, Sir, that something material may be done so that the city shall always be prepared to fight this terrible disease effectually. We are told that epidemics occur only at stated periods, some say quinquennially. Late experience teaches us that they must be looked for almost annually. The argument is put forward that any special preparation made for small-pox treatment would be practically useless at other times. But, Sir, for what purpose does a country maintain a standing army? Will a wise Government or a wise General wait until the enemy is at the gates before they organise an army to meet that enemy? With a well-equipped and well-organized army, we are prepared to strike as soon as the enemy shows himself, and small-pox is a terrible enemy to meet. The better prepared we are to meet him the less chance will there be of his doing the awful havoc we read about almost daily. I would ask, Sir, if it could not be arranged to largely increase the permanent accommodation of the Campbell Hospital for small-pox patients and to provide a second permanent (not temporary) small-pox hospital, which would be of easy access to the northern portion of the city.

“In this connection I would draw attention to another serious danger. I know that segregation is not compulsory nor can we compel patients to go

[*Mr. Larmour ; Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

to a hospital. If all did go, moreover, it would be very little use, as there would not be sufficient space to accommodate them in existing circumstances. But, Sir, some effort might be made in this direction if the leaders of the Indian community would exert their influence with the more humble and ignorant among their fellow-countrymen to induce them to take more advantage of the means offered for fighting the disease and preventing its being communicated to others. In my own experience and among my own employees, I have known men attacked with the malady make straight for their native villages rather than go to the hospital, taking with them and disseminating infection wherever they go and in whatever sort of conveyance they may travel. Could not legislation be introduced to prevent people travelling by rail who are known to be suffering from small-pox? Any remedy that may be devised by the Government and any measures which might be introduced to fight this awful malady would, I am sure, be gladly welcomed and met with the heartfelt gratitude of the whole community."

The Hon'ble BABU DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI said :—“ May it please Your Honour—It is a matter of congratulation that some of the questions raised on the occasion of the last Budget debate received kind consideration at the hands of the authorities, and we gratefully recognize, among other things,—that in framing the year's Budget four years' figures have been supplied for comparison; that the educational charges have been shown in greater detail and under intelligible heads (though many more might well have been added); that the long-lost privilege of District Judges to allow casual leave to the subordinate judiciary has been restored; that in separating the judicial cadre of East Bengal from ours, the needs of the services have been to some extent kept in view; that the question of raising the status and pay of our teachers and professors has been taken up in right earnest and is now before the Government of India, that provision has been made for the housing of Indian professors in the Presidency-town, where living is so dear; that a time-limit has been declared regarding the publication of Government educational works which will give some relief to private authors; and last, though not the least, that the official Gazette is to be supplied to non-official Members and possibly in time the Civil List and other official publications may also be supplied. The list might probably be considerably added to if a statement of Budget proposals and the action thereon were circulated, as I ventured to suggest should be done.

“ With a downright Adversity Budget, without any margin of expansion except with special Imperial grants, little good would it do to dilate on schemes involving extra expenses, and the only useful function of the Budget critic would be to point to possible retrenchment and re-arrangement. But this is impossible in the absence of detailed departmental budgets, which members interested in particular departments have asked for in vain. The normal function of a rupee now-a-days must be to do the work of two, and without necessary details to work on in time, the lay financier must hesitate to rush in where life-long experts fear to tread. One cannot help remarking on the gloomy pall of an Imperial deficit overcasting Provincial resources, which require special augmenting and strengthening from year to year under the exigencies of a cast-iron Settlement System. Those, however, that have the not ill founded impression that careful handling of the Provincial finances can to a certain extent and for the time being avert and counter-balance the effects of Imperial adversity, may be pardoned for asking, without quoting Madras precedents, if in the near past Provincial control and manipulation of finances have been uniformly on the right lines, and if so, why there has been this steady deterioration of the balance, though many of the causes so lucidly detailed by the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary on Friday before last are not of five years' standing. The earmarked fifty lakhs of rupees, which was trust money and should have been laid out on interest—the sanction of the Government of India would not have been wanting in better years and with the amount intact—was unwarrantably treated as part of the supposed-to-be-available cash balance, and in time the usual forgetfulness was induced and a part of the Trust money was swept away along with the real balance—even to the extent of the minimum working balance

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

insisted on by the Secretary of State. It is not a cheery state of things to have been able to make the two ends barely meet out of a grudging Imperial dole in times of its own adversity, and gratitude for such relief has been properly expressed in this Council, and in the Imperial Council. Little sorrow and less surprise must be felt if for the time being we have lost caste in the Supreme Secretariat, for Provincial finances can hardly prosper during persistently successive 'one foot on the road and one foot on the chariot' régimes, that were commented on during the last Budget debate. We rejoice, Sir, that our kaleidoscopic Revenue administration is to be at an end for at least five years, and that the loose screws here, as everywhere else, will be tightened, under a policy of continuity, and that a firm and capable financial handling is to characterise the administration of Bengal, with one at the head of its affairs who knows Bengal and Bengal finances as thoroughly as he knows the finances of India and who has a due appreciation of all larger aspects. This is specially fortunate in view of the approaching Provincial Settlement when we hope to get back our own, and one is almost thankful that the Settlement is not immediately to be revised during a period of stress and strain, and with the memory of our financial feats still fresh in the Indian Secretariat. The cause of Bengal was powerfully and effectively pleaded in the Imperial Council, for which our thanks are due to Your Honour and the Hon'ble Mr. Slacke, and we hope to have better times when we have a rationally and sympathetically revised Settlement.

"The gloomy outlook all round, financial as well as political, very materially affects the interests of education. By the criminal folly of a few, which the community denounces and deplors, the cause of education, the sole salvation of our country, has been put back by many a year. And the difficulties have been seriously augmented by crippled Government resources. We gratefully recognise our rapid educational advance during the last five years, and we hope that when the clouds roll by and during the next five years, there will be still more marked advance, in spite of the prevailing gloom. But the advance by 95 per cent. which has brought up the total to no more than 55½ lakhs to meet the needs of a continent, is only an index of the apathy of those in authority during the years preceding the last five years, and marks the beginning of a new sympathetic era, for inauguration of which all honour is due to Sir Andrew Fraser, and which will be brighter and more fruitful under Your Honour's fostering care, that was watchful even when Your Honour was Finance Member. Let us hope, Sir, that under the new scheme now under the consideration of the Government of India, it will be possible to translate to their proper sphere of work, eminent and capable educationists who have received their training in England, who are doing their work thoroughly and worthily, and some of whose names are household words in the Educational and Scientific world. This would be a bare act of justice—a great encouragement to good and sound work, and would also be instrumental in giving appreciable relief to the worthy and hardworked Subordinate Service, whose claims and cause I have placed before Your Honour's Government through the Hon'ble the Judicial and General Secretary, and with the details of which representation I shall not burden the Budget debate, as I felt it my duty to do last year. Provisions have no doubt been made for strengthening the staffs of Government colleges; but if the realities of the situation are to be faced, much larger grants would be necessary to bring our colleges up to the proper University standard. How exacting that standard is and has to be under the law is well known to all; and if things are not yet quite correct in Government colleges, how can better or even as good things be expected in our private colleges with their slender and precarious means? Musalman, Hindu and European Senators whom I have consulted all earnestly urge larger expenditure. We are supremely grateful to you, Sir, for appreciating the real state of our private colleges which Your Honour referred to with such effect in the Supreme Council the other day and I trust that means will soon be placed at your Honour's disposal for affording them the necessary relief, without which the very existence of some of them will be impossible. Some of our Government colleges are so manned that in the case of the Sanskrit College affiliation in M. A. for Sanskrit had to be withdrawn and no affiliation in History was possible in Patna, and the courses

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

of studies in many another college had to be cramped and curtailed. The Madrassa affairs, again, are in a deplorable condition, as the Vice-Chancellor had occasion to point out in his last Convocation address. The grants that Your Honour has been good enough to provide in the case of the Sanskrit College and the Madrassa may bring them some relief for the time being, but the larger questions have soon to be taken up. Regarding the Presidency College, the idea of removing which has been definitely abandoned, the improvement *in situ* must be on a much larger scale, for any real good, and though the buildings cannot be immediately undertaken, as your Honour stated the other day, acquisition of more land ought not to be deferred, for land will become more and more valuable every day. If the Ranchi scheme, now indefinitely postponed, be finally abandoned, may not the Presidency College hope to benefit by the reversion of the munificence of the Maharajadhiraja of Burdwan who takes such warm interest in all public matters? In this connection I would invite Your Honour's attention to the suggestion of some eminent educationists to convert the Presidency College into a self-contained and self-governing Corporation, which may be well supplemented by the Hooghly College, within such easy reach of Calcutta. If this is done, a considerable portion of the Mooshin Fund would be free for concentration on the bettering of Arabic and Persian education in some given centre and greater attention may also be paid to *mukhtabs*. Creation of similar Corporations would be possible in the near future in the case of the Medical College and the Civil Engineering College, as it will soon be an accomplished fact in the case of the proposed University Law College. The Law College grant, by the way, is far too small for good work, and I hope the matter will be reconsidered in better years, and some assistance to deserving private Law Colleges will also be vouchsafed. These Corporations, when in full working order, would relieve the Government of much of the anxiety, though not of pecuniary responsibility in regard to higher education, and would enable the Government to cope more effectively with Primary and Secondary Education, or rather Secondary and Primary Education, to quote Mr. Kuchler's order of precedence with which I am inclined to agree.

"Speaking of the Engineering College, there is a volume of opinion against its removal from the neighbourhood of Calcutta. Sir Oliver Lodge has been telling an appreciative audience of late that an Industrial and Scientific University cannot afford to be far away from factory chimneys; and though it may be too late to cancel the Ranchi Removal Scheme, against which some experts have always held, it is to be hoped that some Government Technical Institute will be maintained in the neighbourhood of our docks and mills and factories and our Electric installations somewhat on the lines of the model institutions that I tried to indicate last year. The National Council of Education and the Bengal Technical Institute, which are manfully exerting themselves amidst gathering gloom, have an important and assured place in our technological education, particularly if they can come together, and are doing useful work in this direction, and it is a matter of congratulation to those interested in their work that the maintenance of strict discipline on absolutely educational lines is firmly insisted on in these struggling institutions.

"The provision for training of teachers and *gurus*, which is fairly large, is a work in the right direction. Some provision has also been made for training of female teachers, which will demand expansion in the immediate future, as ardent and capable educationists like Mrs. P. K. Ray and Miss Dass, who have studied the subject here and in England, assure us with emphasis. So long as our means are strictly limited, teaching and turning out of capable teachers must be the bulk of our work in the domain of Primary Education, and, wherever we can afford it, these teachers ought to be better paid than they are at present. Building of guru-training schools, which somehow got stunted last year and for which provision has this year been made, is therefore a profitable investment, especially as we recognise that Primary Education on the extensive scale demanded by some cannot be undertaken for a long while to come. Why however 'buildings' come under the heading 'Education,' passes many of our comprehension, but that is a matter which I shall not now attempt to discuss. Filtration downwards which is the only feasible course

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

under the circumstances will be possible and easy if we can get well-trained and capable teachers in abundance who, because of their training, will make teaching their life's work, and the University has recognised this by instituting a degree in teaching which is unfortunately not yet very largely sought for. The education of our females is the only domain of education in which, according to Mr Orange, money trouble is not a difficulty, and I trust that at least in this direction our progress in the near future will be marked, though our resources are small.

"In the important matter of training up of teachers, the contributions of the National Council of Education and the newly-started Frœbel Society are likely to be useful, and when, between the exertions of these private agencies and the University and the Government a fair supply of qualified teachers, whose continuous services can be had on reasonable terms, is ensured, the expansion of our educational work, especially secondary and primary, will be practically assured. In connection with the work of training, I find a grant for training of pleaders in survey work. Useful and important as that work undoubtedly is for facilitating partition proceedings, I hardly think that these charges should come under the heading 'Educational'; and I may be permitted to express a doubt as to whether under the new condition of things the Pleadership Examination, if it is to be continued on the present lines, had not best go to the Education Department under some control by the University. Speaking of Law Examinations, there is no apparent provision in the Budget for Law Scholarships in places like Cuttack, where Law classes have been abolished, the establishment of which scholarships has practically been promised as essential in the interest of the Law students of the affected localities, as well as for the success of the proposed Law College. I fully sympathise with the Hon'ble Mr. Dass in his appeal for larger educational grants for Orissa, and I hope that expansion will soon be possible. I regret to notice the omission of any provision for assisting deserving private Arts Schools, whose good work by way of supplementing the work of the Government School of Arts has been recognised, and whose struggles cannot last much longer unless substantial help, either from the Government or the public, be immediately forthcoming. Though the public may not be doing all that it could or should for educational advancement, it is interesting to note in Mr. Orange's recent report that out of 559 lakhs spent in British India on education in 1907, of which Government has information, only 296 lakhs were spent by the Government; and out of 401 lakhs similarly spent in 1902, Government spent 177 lakhs. The list of 'private educational endeavours here indicated is of course by no means complete.

"I shall now shortly refer once more to the disproportionate character of directing and inspecting charges to which reference has been incidentally made by the Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal. The directing charges have risen from 68 thousand rupees in 1902 to a lakh and 12 thousand in 1909, and the inspection charges from 2 lakhs 60 thousand to 7 lakhs 18 thousand. Whatever the numerical strength of the inspecting agency may be—and some increase was no doubt necessary on account of the increase in the number of institutions affected—its efficiency compared to the older standard is seriously questioned by some who have the advantage of knowing both the standards. There is a growing feeling that the costs of inspection have been needlessly added to by duplication and by introduction of less efficient and more expensive elements for doing work which the more experienced and efficient and less costly units were so long doing quite satisfactorily; and that the latter still continues and must continue to do the real work, while the former merely helps in augmenting the costs. This feeling may not be entirely well grounded, but it is impossible not to think that we should be very much better off for more teachers and professors and better teachers and professors than for increase of the inspecting agency without appreciable increase in the inspectable commodity. The directing agency which has doubled in cost during the period I am speaking of, affects colleges and schools as well, but the inspecting agency, the cost of which has trebled, affects only the schools. And yet, in spite of increased expenditure, 'reports with regard to the quality of the men recruited as Sub Inspectors are unfavourable, and doubt is thrown on the suitability of the present Deputy Inspectors

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

for the responsible charge of the education of the district,' which probably betokens demands for more expenditure in this direction.

"The amounts affected by Inspection are as follows:—

(a) Government Schools—General	12·89
(b) Ditto Special	10·01
			Total	22·90

To control the work thus represented costs us 7 lakhs 18 thousand, *plus*, let us say, half the directing charges, or a sum of 66 thousand, which gives a total in round numbers of nearly eight lakhs, or, in other words, inspection costs about one-third of what teaching costs. I am willing to include in the latter item the grants-in-aid amounting to 11 lakhs, and even the grant in scholarships amounting to a lakh and 85 thousand, for a portion of the inspection works lies in this direction, which would bring up the figure to 35 lakhs and 75 thousand of which the Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal does not take note. Even this makes the inspecting charges disproportionately large, and I have heard of instances in which the cost of travelling of the Inspectresses of Schools came up to many times the paltry grant made to an out-of-the-way girls' school, which the mere man of an Inspector might have comfortably taken in the course of his usual round without serious jeopardy to any interests. In Bengal there are 390 High Schools inspected by 12 Inspectors, giving an average of 32 schools to each Inspector in six Divisions. The sanctioned number of Inspectresses is two and the number of Inspectors is twelve for the six Divisions and one for European Schools, besides a number of Subordinate Inspectors and Inspectresses, which agency has a marked tendency to grow. An experienced European Inspector, however, writes:—

'Another clerk on Rs. 30 a month will greatly add to the working capacity and efficiency of Deputy Inspectors, and would be more beneficent to inspection work than an Additional Deputy Inspector, for what interferes with the proper discharge of their duties is the growing administrative work and *not the growth of schools.*'

"I do plead, therefore, that so long as our resources are not limitless, we should apply more to the work proper than to supervision, which is not unoften more fanciful than needful. And I would once again urge on the necessity of continuity in our professorial work, which often suffers by drafting of Inspectors from its ranks. So long as our resources are limited, by careful re-arrangement and anxious reorganization alone can the money's worth be fully secured, and this I hope will engage the attention of the Educational authorities in the near future. Unless some of the grants are immediately increased and new grants are made, some of our schools and colleges will be absolutely crippled and cease to exist, for the University regulations are inexorable. As Your Honour very forcefully pointed out the other day in the Supreme Council, we are insisting upon that in the case of private schools and colleges which the Government finds it difficult to provide in its own institutions. Our teachers and professors can for a while be trusted to do their work without overinspection, and let us not come to a stage when the Inspecting Agency will flourish in its glory and the inspectable institutions will be gradually attaining the vanishing point.

"As time will not allow a detailed examination of many other important subjects which might well claim our attention, I shall merely indicate very shortly some of the more pressing ones:—

(1) The grant for *anti-malarial* operations and jungle clearing, for which His Highness the Hon'ble the Nawab Bahadur of Murshidabad pleaded so hard, is far too small.

(2) Grants for improvement of the Puri drainage and Puri Water-works last year are insufficient. Sanitation of important places of pilgrimage and health resorts like this and of sanitariums like Madhupur and Baidyanath ought to be a matter of Government concern. In the latter connection I would once more press upon the attention of Government whether the question of the Sonthal Parganas ceasing to be non-regulation districts ought not to be soon taken up.

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

“Speaking of matters connected with Orissa, in which I presume to take a good deal of interest even in the presence of the Hon’ble Member for Orissa, I may be permitted to remind Your Honour that the building of the Cuttack Courts, which, as Your Honour has seen, are in a perfectly miserable condition, should be taken up as soon as possible.

(3) The question of re-organization and strengthening of the ministerial department of the Original Side of the High Court is a pressing one. I do not know whether this will come into the larger question of ministerial re-organization for which budget provision has been made, and if not, the revision of the Original Side establishment cannot be further deferred.

(4) The Begua Hanna embankment and the Tolly’s nala improvement questions, which have been indefinitely put off, ought to be brought to the fore without delay.

(5) The increase in the pay of the Advocate-General, which was largely due, I believe, to the work of the Eastern Bengal Government, ought not to be wholly or even largely borne by this Government. I desire to associate myself with every word that the Hon’ble Babu Radha Charan Pal has said about the appointment of our hon’ble colleague Mr S. P. Sinha to the high office of Law Member.

“I trust that the Government will not seriously think of renewing the experiment of bringing out an Advocate-General from England, to which reference has been made by the Hon’ble Mr. Madhu Sudan Das. I would remind the Government of the failure of such an experiment in Madras many years ago. Nor is it likely of course that the Madras experiment of appointing a Vakil as Advocate-General will soon find official favour in this country.

(6) There is no apparent provision for the separation of Judicial and Executive Services, though some provision has been made regarding the Council Reform Scheme, in connection with which it is to be hoped that better facilities will be afforded to non-official members.

(7) Necessity of bettering our Subordinate Judicial Service by providing a Munsif’s grade on Rs. 500 on the lines adopted in Eastern Bengal and by allowing officiating periods to count towards pension, which is now being allowed, I believe, even in Burma. Detailed enumeration of various questions affecting this service will take up a long time and may be considered out of place in this Council, and I have addressed the Hon’ble the Judicial Secretary separately on the subject, setting forth various aspects which, I hope, will receive attention in due time.

(8) Provision ought to be made for restoring the old scale of travelling allowance to our Sub-Deputy Collectors. I believe the Government of India allowed in 1907 an increased halting allowance at the rate of Rs. 3 a day, which the officers concerned were allowed to draw for four or five months, after which it was unaccountably reduced. These officers have to keep conveyances and more than one establishment and have to do much by the way of keeping up *prestige* which even better-paid officers can ill afford to do. As it is they cannot make the two ends meet on their meagre pay, and the restoration of the increased halting allowance is the least that can be done to give them relief in these hard times.

(9) The bettering of the status of our Assistant Surgeons is no less needed than that of Civil Hospital Assistants that has been considerably provided for this year, and some hopes were held out last year for their betterment which have not been realized. In this connection I would repeat my last year’s suggestion that non-official medical talent may well be availed of, at least in connection with some of the excellent cottage hospitals which Your Honour opened the other day.

(10) A portion of the property escheated to Government, which represents the earnings of unfortunates, ought to be devoted to the maintenance of Refuge Homes, which would be a great help to the Purity movement. Private and Missionary help would be forthcoming if the matter is taken up.

(11) In a recent resolution in the Calcutta Gazette we find that the *Golden Crown* is a small and ancient type of trawler, and is by no means adequate for the work she has to perform, *viz.*, the exploitation of the Bay. The vessel was purchased last year before the Budget came up for consideration,

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari ; Babu Gajadhar Prasad.*]

and opposition to this excellent investment was withdrawn because it was pointed out that the purchase was already an accomplished fact and because great things were predicted. The extract from the resolution I have just read is a notable commentary on the situation, to which I have no desire to add. But unless it be quite clear that the concern can be run, either by the Government or even a private agency, on a strictly business-like basis with success, it is questionable whether the Budget allowance of this year would lead to any useful purpose, whether from a scientific or economic point of view.

(12) The Vice-Chancellor and his colleagues on the Syndicate are grateful to the Hon'ble the Home Member for more than once appreciatively referring to their difficult work, and we are also thankful that the Imperial Government has been able to make a small University grant. But the University stands in immediate need of help, both from Your Honour's Government and the Government of India, for acquiring the fish-market to the south of the Senate House, the existence of which forbade a late Vice-Chancellor's holding Saturday meetings in hot weather. It is not from the point of view of personal comfort or even sanitary consideration that the acquisition is needed. Sooner or later we must have this land, and later on we shall have to pay a good deal more. In the present state of financial difficulty a secured loan on a proper basis is the only solution, and I trust it will be possible to put it through before long.

“Important questions arise in connection with Excise Administration and the Municipal Administration of Calcutta. I shall not refer to these matters, as legislation is pending in connection with the former and legislation may soon be looked forward to in connection with the latter, on lines indicated by the Report of the Decentralization Commission, which we gratefully recognise are in accordance with Your Honour's own long-cherished views and to which effect is soon likely to be given. One of the incidental matters which engaged the attention of that Commission was the relationship between officials and non-officials in this country, for the Commission rightly considered that the excellence of such relations is one of the best assets of the Government. Those relations will assuredly be of the best during a *régime* inaugurated by the statesmanlike utterances that we had the honour and pleasure of listening to in this Chamber on the first day that Your Honour took your seat. Sincere and unstinted cordiality of the kind manifest on the Belvedere lawn, not many days ago, when junior University men were Your Honour's delighted guests, is never thrown away on a people proverbially thankful for the smallest of small mercies, and the regrettable episodes of the last twelve months, which were dimly foreseen when we were discussing our last Budget, will soon, let us hope, be things veritably and eternally of the past. Your Honour will soon be visiting a field of your early labours—Purulia; that, Sir, is a field where the foundation of your great and illustrious career was laid, truly broad-based upon the goodwill of a grateful people; for there under the sombre shadows around *Sahab Band*, Your Honour gave some of the first indications of life-long goodwill towards the people eventually entrusted to your care and guidance, when freely and without restraint you allowed your heartfelt and heart-winning sympathy to flow towards those that ordinarily would be nothing and nobodies to a powerful District Officer in their great and abiding grief. The memory of such striking co-mingling of feelings is bound to be ever dear and green in the hearts of all that know or hear.”

The Hon'ble BABU GAJADHAR Prasad said:—“A year of a famine cannot be a year of 'Prosperity Budget.' The budget is, it must be admitted, characterised by exceptional clearness and lucidity, upon which I must congratulate the Financial Secretary. It is no easy task to prepare a budget when there is an increase of expenditure accompanied by a reduction of income. However, as matters stand, we must see how the money at the disposal of our Government can be best used.

“I cannot help expressing my sincere gratification at the increase in the expenditure on education. Within the last few years there has been a marked increment under this head, and this is wholly justifiable; indeed, I may go so

{*Babu Gajadhar Prasad.*}

far as to say that this is yet inadequate. Education needs much more than the sum which has been allotted to it. In this connection, I deem it my duty to speak a word or two about the grants-in-aid given by Government to the private colleges in Bihar. The existence of these colleges is essentially necessary to the education of the people of the province. Bihar, I understand, gets only Rs. 2,300 a year. What Bengal gets is hardly adequate to her needs; but what Bihar gets is utterly insufficient. Circumstances compel me to renew my appeal to your Honour's Government on behalf of the private colleges in Bihar. Bihar is doubtless a backward province, and it certainly deserves support from Government and sympathy from advanced Bengal. The Bihar National College deserves special consideration. Doctors P. K. Ray and P. Brühl say regarding this institution, in their inspection report, dated 14th November 1908 '.....there is great need of the college in Bankipore. The Government College alone cannot meet the demand for higher education there.....The college has, at present, a Government grant of Rs 200 per month. This is quite inadequate.' Mr. Earle, the Commissioner of Patna, has also strongly recommended an increase of the grant to this institution. I hope your Honour's Government will increase the grant. The Patna College is the only Government College in Bihar and Biharis expect that it will be affiliated up to the M. A. Standard in every subject as soon as practicable.

"Anarchism and State Prosecutions.—There is one item of expenditure, the necessity for which we all deeply deplore: I mean the expenditure on State prosecutions. Here the innocent and the guilty have been placed under the same category; both equally suffer for the fault of only the latter. But I do not know how it can be easily avoided. The people should co-operate with the Government in suppressing anarchism, which is fatal to all peace and prosperity in the country. Our countrymen will not, I hope, forget the lesson which this year's budget teaches them. The crime of anarchism must be rooted out in the best way possible.

"Agricultural and Famine.—I have to draw the special attention of your Honour's Government to the agricultural needs of the province under your Honour's charge. India was known to be the granary of the East, and Bengal was said to be the granary of India. But what is the fact to-day? Famine reigns rampant, and lakhs of people of our part of the country do not know what it is to have two meals a day. Everywhere we hear complaints of drought. Everywhere we see barren fields and ruined crops. Agriculture was the main source of our prosperity. If agriculture fails, all other avocations are directly or indirectly, but seriously, affected, and the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary is right when he says that the revenues of Government have been affected by the rise in the price of staple food-crops. No pains should be spared to make agriculture highly attractive. We are much obliged to Government for the establishment of the Agricultural College in our midst. The agricultural associations are useful institutions. But that is not enough to prevent famine. The most important question is—How should drought or the effect of drought be avoided? The effects of drought may be avoided by (a) a system of canal irrigation, (b) by a system of well irrigation. And drought may be prevented by (1) the preservation of forests, and (2) the planting of trees. The system of canal irrigation has already proved useful. It is certainly not unsuited to our soil and our climate. And what is more, the recent Revenue Report of the Public Works Department (Irrigation Branch) amply shows that it is not a losing concern. I do not hesitate therefore to plead for its extension. If this system of irrigation is extended, it will help the agriculturists to a great extent and will not be a burden to the financial resources of Government. Much of the unrest prevailing in the country would doubtless disappear if the agricultural condition of the country were considerably improved. As regards well irrigation, I have sometimes had to speak from my seat in this Council, but I venture again to commend it to your Honour's Government. With the help of water-lifting machines, well water can be very well utilised for irrigation purposes, and I feel sure Government will not be a loser. The next point to which I have to draw the attention of your Honour's Government is the planting of trees and the preservation of forests. It is, I believe, a

[Babu Gajadhar Prasad.]

settled theory that the preservation of forests helps the rains. The failure of rains has much to do with the failure of crops. It seems necessary, therefore, to preserve the forests. The planting of trees, I respectfully submit, is necessitated by the circumstances of the present day. Many forests have been cut. In order to make up what we have lost, trees should be planted. Mr. J. H. Lea, our popular Collector of Patna, proposed in a speech which he delivered at Patna, that the 'Arbour Day' might be celebrated in India. I fully agree with him.

"There have been numerous complaints by many Indian thinkers regarding the use which is made of the Road-cess Fund and the Public Works Cess Fund. It is urged that these ought not to have been levied at all; these have been levied against the spirit of the Permanent Settlement; and now that they have been levied they ought to be applied to the removal of the needs of the landlord and the tenant. But be that as it may, I am humbly of opinion that a considerable portion of these Funds may reasonably be used for help to the agriculturists in irrigation matters. There are several District Board roads, which have to cross rivulets and have large bridges over them. Is it impracticable to have shutters in these bridges and thus to utilise these natural water-channels for irrigation purposes? All new bridges may have shutters, and the rivulets may, to some extent, serve the purposes of reservoirs and canals. Is it not also possible to use the Famine Relief Funds for helping irrigation? Is there any harm if irrigation works in place of roads are undertaken as relief-works, whenever there be any necessity for such relief? I beg respectfully to make these suggestions for your Honour's consideration. I may here note, it is not possible for an ordinary zamindar to establish any such irrigation system in his zamindari.

"*Excise Bill.*—The Excise Bill is pending before the Council. I am glad to be able to congratulate your Honour's Government upon the Bill which has been framed and introduced. Government has in this Bill recognised to some extent the well known principle that in all matters relating to excise the voice of the people should always be respected. But the Bill does not go far enough in this direction. The 'Local Option' principle is one which deserves your Honour's consideration. The voice of the people should always be allowed to prevail in the matter of the location of shops. We are grateful to your Honour for the circular your Honour has issued, recognising such a principle.

"*Jail.*—The treatment of Hindu under-trial prisoners is, I humbly submit not quite satisfactory. They are provided with iron plates for taking their meals. I suggest that they may be given brass plates instead of iron ones. I think the difference in the cost will not be high. Hindus and Muhammadans may be separately seated at dinner times. A Brahmin prisoner or a Brahmin cook may be appointed to cook their food: the arrangement can be easily made, and I hope the Government will not fail to do it.

"*Reform Schemes.*—The Reform Scheme is, no doubt, an Imperial scheme, but your Honour's Government is so much concerned with it and your Honour has shown so much sympathy for it that I cannot resist the temptation of speaking a little about it. It is an unfortunate circumstance that there has been a strong opposition in England to the inclusion of clause 3 in the Bill. The Bill would lose much of its value if this clause were omitted therefrom. But we all fervently hope that Government will steadily and sympathetically work for the speedy introduction of the proposed reforms and will not allow the progress of the reforms to be hampered by the anarchical crimes of some foolish misguided youths who have adopted an attitude which is undoubtedly detrimental to the best interests of our motherland. All the leading men of our society should strive their best for the boycotting of all such men as have or as may be proved to have the least connection with any such revolutionary movement. It is a duty which we owe to ourselves, to our country, as also to the youngsters concerned.

"I believe I express the Bihar public opinion when I say that Bihar is very much indebted to Your Honour for the promptitude with which Your Honour's Government met the demand for a Lectureship in History at the Patna College. That Your Honour's Government has in spite of all financial difficulties

[*Babu Gajadhar Prasad; Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan; Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur.*]

been able to set apart a considerable sum of money for the establishment of a Law College at Patna, bears testimony to the interest which Your Honour's Government takes in the welfare of the Biharis. The abolition of the Audit fee and the Banking fee will be a great help to all local self-governing bodies and we are deeply grateful to Government for it. Your Honour's Budget speech in the Viceregal Council amply evidences your paternal care for the people committed to your charge. Your anxiety to satisfy the local needs of the people has raised high hopes in their minds and has already endeared you to them."

The Hon'ble MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR OF BURDWAN said:—"Your Honour, our funds are so limited, that I really hardly need to take up the time of the Council on any point in the Budget that was introduced not so very long ago by my hon'ble friend, the Financial Secretary.

"My first duty is a pleasant one, and that is to thank the Government for providing the sum of Rs. 40,000 for the Burdwan Central Hospital. It is an institution, Sir, that has been badly needed, and to me, personally, it is a matter of gratification to know that the scheme I launched about two years ago has begun to bear fruit, and that before very long we may hope to be able to boast that we have one of the best mufassal hospitals in Bengal.

"I now turn to a more important question, that of the Ranchi College Scheme. Knowing fully the financial difficulties that we are in at present, I cannot very well ask Your Honour's Government to provide for the carrying out of the Ranchi College in the immediate future, but that is no reason for thinking of abandoning the scheme altogether. The scheme, Sir, I may assure Your Honour, has the fullest sympathy of many people in Bengal, and who, I may say, have felt keenly disappointed that first of all the scheme should be discarded for a long time in the Secretariat of the India Government, and when it does receive the sanction of the Secretary of State in a modified form, and the India Government, it should have to be indefinitely postponed owing to the shortness of money. I only mention the Ranchi College Scheme, Sir, for Your Honour's consideration, and may, I hope, Sir, on behalf of my friends who are interested in this scheme and my humble self, that if the Government of India is able to make a further grant to the Bengal Government, that the Ranchi College Scheme will not be lost sight of.

"I now turn, Sir, to the provision made for the Fishery inquiries in Bengal. While fully concurring with my hon'ble friend, the Financial Secretary, that, later on, the Fishery inquiries ought to be taken up by private enterprise, I trust that the Government will be able to demonstrate to the public more fully in the future the results of the Fishery inquiries in Bengal, and convince the public of the useful utility of the large amount of public money being spent on this purpose. Being a member of the Committee of the Fishery Board, I have just come across some rules that have been framed and circulated amongst the members of the Committee, that tend to show that, for the improvement of the breed of fish in Bengal, there is a likelihood of an encroachment upon private fishery rights. If it is desirable to make pisciculture a popular industry, Sir, in Bengal, I trust Government will look into this matter carefully, and see that unnecessary official interference is not allowed over private fishery rights. With these few remarks, Sir, I have pleasure in supporting the Budget as it now stands."

The Hon'ble RAI KISHORI LAL GOSWAMI BAHADUR said:—"Your Honour.—The canons of debate over the Financial Statement which Your Honour, as President of this Council, laid down at our last sitting, and to which we all must respectfully submit, have considerably restricted the scope of discussion over the Financial Statement for the year that has just set in—a statement in which, with arduous care, the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary has managed to make the two ends meet. In a year of such exceptional financial stress, it will be futile to discuss important schemes or any ambitious programme of capital expenditure which a progressive administration would demand. I shall therefore be brief and confine my observations to what strictly comes within the four corners of the statement, so lucidly placed

[*Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur.*]

before us by the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary. I must, however, frankly confess at the outset to a slight sense of disappointment at the restraint imposed on the Budget debate, in that it has deprived the non-official members of an opportunity to present before Your Honour, in such methodical forms as each one is capable of, their criticisms on the administration of this Province, and to listen to such explanations as the official members might choose to offer in order to remove misconceptions or throw light on such administrative questions as are misunderstood or are not clear to public minds. I have advisedly used the word 'slight' in view of the increased facilities for effective debate and discussion in connection with the Financial Statement which form an important feature of the reformed proposals, enunciated and discussed in the Government of India's despatch to Lord Morley, dated the 1st October, 1908, and published in the Blue Books on the subject—facilities, which God-willing, will be available to the Hon'ble Members when the next Provincial Budget will be introduced in the enlarged Council.

"We are grateful to the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary for the fuller information contained in his Financial Statement which has helped a better comprehension of several important items of expenditure. While presenting the Financial Statement at the last meeting of this Council, he alluded to the new features in his statement, and I therefore shall not repeat them. I, however, humbly believe that there still remains much to be desired in the way of elucidation of the Budget figures. I shall briefly submit my views to show in what respects still fuller information will prove of great assistance to the non-official members in understanding the expenditure side of the statement. With Your Honour's leave I shall repeat what I said last year on this point. 'A fuller and more specific information is needed to explain for what specific purposes the grants for Civil Works in charge of the Civil Officers and of the Public Works Department and for the larger items of non-recurring charges will be spent. The present Financial Statement, like those that have preceded it, omits to furnish sufficient clue by which the non-official members and the outside public can find out to what extent allotments made for useful public purposes in a year have not been wholly or partially utilised in the year, together with such explanations as would be deemed necessary, showing particularly how far the unexecuted portions of the works are covered by re-grants in the succeeding year.' Then again, I say, without meaning the slightest disrespect, there is an absence of method in the selection of the items of expenditure under the head 'Civil Works.' Referring to the detailed remarks on the Budget of the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary (paragraph 59), I find some building works or other works of like character in connection with Law Courts, Jails, Arts and other Colleges, Medical Institutions and Police are included under 'Civil Works'; while, on the other hand, charges for similar works are also included in other heads of expenditure. A scrutiny of the expenditure under the heads of 'Police' and 'Education' will make this point clear. In the former, Sir, there is not a single item of expenditure on account of building works of any kind for the accommodation of the Police or for Police Training Schools or for some other purpose connected with the Police force. Under the head 'Education' I find, that under sub-head 'Government Colleges,' a portion of the item of expenditure for Arts Colleges for boys represents provision for improvements of the Presidency College, Rs. 4,000 and Rs. 9,000, respectively, have been allotted for the improvements of the Sanskrit College and the Calcutta Madrassa—by these improvements, I presume, additions to the College buildings are meant (of course I speak subject to correction)—and Rs. 2,00,000 for Guru-training School buildings, besides, such portions of the expenditure under grants-in-aid as represent charges for school buildings. These should properly and consistently come under Civil Works, either in charge of Public Works Department or Civil Department. This anomaly must necessarily vitiate the calculation of percentages and amounts of increased expenditure under Police and Education as made by the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary at the time of the presentation of the Financial Statement. The Hon'ble the Financial Secretary has, in forcible language and with great earnestness, pointed to us the necessity for the exercise

[*Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur.*]

of caution and economy in the present state of the finance of the Province. It is hardly possible for the non-official members to submit proposals for retrenchment or economy, if they are not fully cognisant of the internal details of all new projects which of course will be initiated and finally disposed of by the Government. All new items in the Budget Estimate involving large expenditure or large increase of expenditure, such as, reorganization of a department, or considerable increase of staff of any branch of service or large constructive works, should be accompanied by such detailed explanation as would enable the non-official member to submit his suggestions in respect thereof in time to admit of an effectual consideration by the Government. I do not propose to labour this point any further, as drastic changes in the mode of preparation and presentation of the Financial Statement at different stages are in view as part of the great Reform Scheme.

"I shall now proceed to submit a few observations on some of the items of expenditure shown in Appendix B of the Financial Statement.

Land Revenue.—Under the sub-head 'Management of Government Estates,' Rs. 74,000 has been allotted for outlay on improvements, a portion of which represents expenses for Fraserganj reclamation works. It is, I tell you, Sir, extremely painful to me to speak disparagingly of anything which bears the honoured and beloved name of Sir Andrew Fraser. It is now proved beyond doubt that the reclamation works in Fraserganj have not been a financial success, and the idea of setting apart a portion of Fraserganj for the purpose of a sanitarium has not found favour with the general public. In these circumstances, the wasteful expenditure of public money for such reclamation works should be stopped.

Stamps.—I have heard complaints of inconvenience from several persons for the discontinuance of the sale of one-anna and unified stamps through stamp vendors, giving them small discount on sales effected by them. An inquiry should be made to see if the revival of the discount system would conduce to public convenience.

General Administration.—We are in the dark as to the efficacy of work done by the Controller of Office System. I humbly ask for a definite pronouncement, if the Government is satisfied that the work he is doing is commensurate with the expenses incurred on that account.

Anarchy and Expenditure.—The Financial Statement reveals what a severe strain on the public purse has been caused by the small band of wicked Anarchists. I wish my countrymen to note particularly how much of public money, which otherwise would have served many beneficent purposes, has been spent for the suppression of the wicked movement towards anarchy and disorder. The expenses are spread over several heads—'Law,' 'Jails' and 'Police.' An examination of these will, I am sure, very much deepen the sense of abhorrence created by their misdeeds. It is hoped that the extra expenditure under these heads, due to the suppression of anarchy and disorder, will not be repeated when anarchical crimes will be extirpated. May God speed the day.

Police.—The two heads of expenditure in which the non-official members as also the outside public, take the keenest interest, are 'Police' and 'Education.' The real ratio between the expenditures under these two heads can be truly and correctly ascertained, if all expenses since the Partition of Bengal incurred for all building works in connection with Police and Education are relegated to the head 'Civil Works' and the receipts under those heads are respectively deducted from the total expenditures. Then a common basis will be established for purposes of comparison. Judged by this criterion, the increase of expenses under the head 'Police' will be found much larger than that under the head 'Education.' I have not omitted to note that a special recurring grant of 14½ lakhs has been made by the Government of India to give effect, so far as possible, to the recommendations of the Police Commission which have been approved by the India Government, nor have I overlooked the extraordinary expenditure required for the detection and suppression of anarchical crimes. We all welcome a reformed Police, but the goal seems to be yet far off and any sign of reform is hardly yet visible.

Education.—(1) No provision has been made for carrying out any one of the many valuable recommendations made in the excellent report of the

[Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur.]

Hon'ble Mr. Cumming. Other Provinces, notably the United Provinces, Madras and Eastern Bengal and Assam, are taking practical steps to give effect to the proposals for the advancement of Technical and Industrial education and for the development of local industries. I most sincerely wish that the hopes of returning prosperity, so sanguinely looked for by the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary, will be fully realised so as to enable him, to make ample room for this purpose in the next Budget estimate.

(2) The scheme for an Arts College at Ranchi, after several vicissitudes of fortune, was given a definite but modest shape by the late Lieutenant-Governor with the concurrence of the Secretary of State. The strong popular opposition to the scheme which owed its origin to the fear that the Presidency College will cease to exist, has now given place, I must say in spite of the views of my hon'ble friend Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari to popular approbation of the less ambitious scheme for establishing an Arts College in Ranchi for teaching up to the B. A. and B. Sc. Standards. It is much to be regretted that after the foundation-stone of the College building was laid last year by Sir Andrew Fraser and having regard to the generous contributions which have been promised by my hon'ble friend the Maharajadhiraja of Burdwan and other noblemen of Bengal in support of that scheme on condition that the construction of the college building should be immediately taken in hand, no allotment has been made in the Budget estimate for the Ranchi College building. There is no necessity for what is called a Rajoomar College in Bengal, but a model college in one of the healthiest parts of the country teaching up to the B. A. and B. Sc. Standards will be largely resorted to by boys belonging to the wealthy and well-to-do families of this Province including the sons of high Indian officials. I regret at the unsympathetic attitude of my friend to my right towards the Ranchi College Scheme, which springs from ignorance of the feelings of a large number of people—notably the well-to-do landed community who have evinced their appreciation in the most tangible form of large subscriptions and the successful gentlemen belonging to the learned professions and also the high Indian officials whom exigencies of public service oblige them to shift from place to place, and therefore feel very much the necessity of placing their boys in such a residential College as has been proposed to be established in Ranchi or it may be my friend has been blinded by an overpowering love for the Presidency College and Colleges in Calcutta. Your Honour will during your visit to Ranchi a few days hence, see the large number of new houses built up and those that are under construction, which are intended mainly to help the owners of the houses to enable them to educate their boys in an atmosphere favourable to health, intellect and morals. I hope Sir, my friend's utterance will not make the 'indefinite postponement' necessitated by financial stringency a postponement *sine die*.

(3) The grant of Rs. 80,000 allowed in three successive years to the struggling private colleges has been stopped this year. The sudden stoppage of this grant, the repetition of which the private colleges looked forward to, at all events for some years to come, will retard the progress of collegiate education as the new University Regulations have burdened them with obligations which they are unable to discharge without State help. However the announcement made by the Finance Member of the Government of India at the last Budget debate in the Viceroy's Council that a grant of Rs. 1,60,000 will be made to Bengal for University Education has inspired the hope that Your Honour will be able to satisfy the legitimate demand of the private colleges for State help. I am entirely at one with Mr. Küchler, the Director of Public Instruction, that schemes for educational improvement should proceed according to the following order of priority (i) Collegiate Education, (ii) Secondary Education, and (iii) Primary Education.

(4) Expenditure on inspection of schools is quite disproportionate to the expenditure on the schools themselves. The expenditure on this head might, in my humble judgment, have been reduced and the saving thus effected might have been diverted to the furtherance of Technical and Industrial education and the Ranchi College Scheme. Anyhow a beginning might have been made in these two directions.

(5) The provision of 2 lakhs for Guru-training school buildings seems to be unnecessary, for it is not proposed to have trained Gurus on an extensive scale as

[Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur.]

the state of the finances both Imperial and Provincial, has rendered the prospect of free and compulsory primary education, dim and distant. Besides, the present requirements for Guru-training school buildings might be met with a very moderate expenditure, as these schools might be located in hired buildings and *chondimondops*. Might it not be possible to divert a portion of this grant to the aforesaid two purposes for which no room has been made in the Budget? Those projects should have precedence over Guru-training school buildings. Educational expenditure owing to the exigencies of finance has been cut down in the same way as Civil Works expenditure, but in the opinion of the public, Education should occupy the foremost place in the Budget, and the expenditure should from year to year be on the ascending scale.

"*Agriculture.*—Agriculture should no longer be treated as a minor department, and the expenditure on Agricultural Department should not be lumped together under the sub-head 'Experimental Cultivation.' The charges for agricultural education ought properly to come under the head 'Education,' and the rest of the expenditure in connection with agriculture should be included in head (Scientific and Other Departments) under a distinctive sub-head, 'Agricultural Improvements.' The cost of direction and supervision should be separated from that of demonstration, improvements and experiments. A more adequate provision should have been made for a larger number of itinerant Agricultural Inspectors.

"*Miscellaneous.*—Out of Rs. 1,85,000 allotted for Special Commission inquiry, Rs. 1,65,000 represents the charges for the Fishery Inquiry. Exploitation of the sea-fisheries for the benefit of a country, the generality of the people of which eat fish, is undoubtedly desirable, but the result of the exploitation since the last monsoon hardly encourages one to persevere with it. In the year which has just set in, the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary has informed us that the anticipated sale-proceeds of fish which will be caught by the steam-trawler *Golden Crown* is Rs. 15,000. That keeps the enterprise very far from a commercial success. I, however, welcome the stimulus to private enterprise which will be afforded by the State Scholarships awarded to some Indian students for the study of Pisciculture in Europe and America. I shall ask Your Honour to seriously ponder over the situation and to decide whether further exploitation should be carried on with such a trawler as the *Golden Crown*.

"The remarks of the Fishery Adviser to the Bengal Government in his last report regarding the *Golden Crown* are rather disheartening. He said: 'It may not be amiss to remark here that the *Golden Crown* is a small and ancient type of trawler, and that her gear is by no means adequate for the work she has to perform, viz., the exploitation of the Bay.'

"*Closing Balance.*—The Hon'ble the Financial Secretary has explained that the causes which contributed to the gradual depletion of the closing balance, reducing 44 lakhs, being the closing balance of 1906-07, to zero in the estimate of the current year are—

- (i) increased expenditure on Public Works;
- (ii) growth of expenditure under the heads of Police and Education;
- (iii) very heavy charges incurred in the payment of grain-compensation allowance; and, lastly,
- (iv) short collections of Land Revenue and diminished Excise and Stamps Revenue owing to Agricultural depression.

"Is this depletion due to reckless expenditure and exceptional causes, such as Famine, Anarchy, etc., or is it due to a radical defect in the method of assignment of Provincial Revenues which are inadequate to cope with the progress of administrative reforms? Your Honour, who has won laurels in the domain of finance has, I am happy to find, made a careful survey of the whole situation and addressed a vigorous appeal in the Viceroy's Council for a revision of the Provincial settlement when the present financial stringency comes to an end. I trust Your Honour's appeal will be generously responded to by the India Government. It is indeed a serious state of affairs that a balance of 14 lakhs of rupees should be wiped out in three years and leave this

[*Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur ; Mr. Thomson ; Mr. Cumming.*]

Province in a state not very far removed from bankruptcy. To the complete absorption of the closing balance of 44 lakhs must be added the Imperial grant of 16 lakhs and 95 thousand to cover provincial deficit, making a total of close upon Rs. 61,00,000.

“ Sir, before I resume my seat, I shall crave your indulgence to refer to two important extraneous matters. On behalf of the Association I have the honour to represent in this Council, I express our sincere admiration of the high statesmanship which has dictated the appointment of the learned Advocate-General of Bengal, the Hon’ble Mr. S. P. Sinha, as the first Indian Law Member of the Council of the Viceroy and Governor General of India. In reply to the welcome accorded to Your Honour on the first day that you occupied the Presidential Chair of this Council, you made certain observations regarding the befitting attitude of the members of the Indian Civil Service towards the people of this country generally, and particularly towards their non-official colleagues in this Council, which have evoked the deepest gratitude of the people of this country and they are viewed by one and all of us as a very salubrious appendant to the noble message of our gracious Sovereign and the lofty principles of modern liberalism on which the Reform Scheme of Lord Morley and Lord Minto are based. In every honest Indian heart there will be a niche for both those noble Lords and they will occupy an abiding place of glory in the pages of the History of India.”

THE HON’BLE MR. THOMSON said:—“ The decrease in the navigation receipts from the Nadia rivers, referred to by the Hon’ble Nawab Bahadur of Murshidabad, is mainly due to a reduction by half of the rates of tolls during the flood season, with effect from June, 1906; and also to short crops, and diversion of traffic to the railways. . As regards improvement of the river channels, dredging in the Bhagirathi is being done solely as a sanitary measure, to increase the supply of drinking-water. The question of keeping open a channel connecting with the Ganges, and navigable for steamers throughout the year, has occupied the attention of Government for many years; but the natural conditions are such as to make it improbable that any efforts in this direction will ever prove permanently successful.

“ The Hon’ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari draws attention to the Begua Hanna embankment, and Tolly’s Nala improvement. Plans and estimates have been prepared for constructing a weir across the Begua breach on the right bank of the Damoodar river, to regulate the flood discharge. The work will be very costly, and will require careful consideration before it is decided on. A project for the improvement of Tolly’s Nala to form part of the steamer route from Khulna to Calcutta has been prepared and submitted to the Government of India.

“ The Hon’ble Mr. Das remarks upon the rise in the cost of establishment under the head of Civil Works. The increase is chiefly due to increased salaries under the Re-organization Scheme sanctioned by the Secretary of State; to smaller contribution by the Government of India on account of Imperial Works; to the appointment of a Consulting Architect; and to additional Electrical establishment.

“ The Hon’ble Babu Gajadhar Prasad pleads for the extension of irrigation. The Government is fully aware of the importance of this matter, and continues to give it most careful attention. The proposal to form reservoirs by putting shutters in road bridges is not practicable to any useful extent.”

THE HON’BLE MR. CUMMING said:—“ Sir, I have to offer a few observations on the remarks of the Hon’ble Members concerning the subjects belonging to the Judicial and General Departments. I take up first matters of the Judicial Department.

“ Regarding the Presidency Honorary Magistrates, it is urged by the Hon’ble Babu Radha Charan Pal that they are being deprived of their privileges. Recently at the instance of the Chief Presidency Magistrate, an increase was made in the number of the Magistrates who are empowered to sit singly. There had been complaints against the delay in the disposal of cases by Honorary Benches.

[Mr. Cumming.]

"As regards the suggestion of the Hon'ble Member for constituting Honorary Benches in the Small Cause Courts, which was also made last year, Government has no pronouncement to make.

"The construction of new buildings for the Cuttack Civil Court, to which the Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari has alluded, is estimated to cost a lakh and a half. Administrative approval has been given. Civil Court buildings are being renewed in three other districts at present.

"The same Hon'ble Member has urged the necessity for improving in two respects the Judicial Branch of the Provincial Civil Service. The Government of India have recently not approved the proposal to appoint a new grade of Munsifs on Rs. 500 in this Province. But as regards the other point on which that Service naturally lays much stress, the Secretary of State has recently sanctioned the proposal that Munsifs should be allowed to count as service qualifying for pension the periods, whether continuous or not, during which they may have held acting appointments.

"The increase of the pay of the Advocate-General is criticised by the Hon'ble Mr. Das, on the assumption that it is meant for the successor to the Hon'ble Mr. Sinha. As a matter of fact, the pay of Rs. 4,000 a month was sanctioned in May, 1908, by the Secretary of State for the case of the Hon'ble Mr. Sinha, who succeeded Mr. O'Kinealy.

"It has been suggested by the Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari that the Pleadorship Examination should be placed under the Education Department. I am afraid I fail to see that any advantage would be gained. The Education Department would have to constitute a Board of Examiners; and a Board of Examiners exists at present, consisting of not less than eight members, the President of which must always be a Judge of the High Court. Government is not aware of any dissatisfaction with the working of the Board, which was constituted twenty-five years ago.

"The Hon'ble Babu Gajadhar Prasad has suggested certain changes in the treatment of under-trial prisoners in jails. As regards the arrangements for the cooking of food by Brahmans and for the separation at meals of Hindus from Muhammadans, and high castes from low castes, the Jail Code lays down considerate instructions; and even allows a prisoner in certain cases to cook for himself, if the caste of the jail cook is not sufficiently high. No complaint has been received about the use of iron plates. If the Hon'ble Member will furnish me precise information concerning the cases which prompted his remarks, the Inspector-General of Prisons will be very pleased to make inquiries.

"An inquiry has been made by the Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal regarding the court-fees of the Calcutta Small Cause Court. By a notification of the 24th October, 1908, some relief to suitors has been given, to take effect from the 1st April, 1909, at an annual estimated loss to Government of Rs. 13,000.

"I next turn to the General Department, which deals principally with educational matters. There is, however, an inquiry from the Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal as to whether the sum of half a lakh provided in the Budget for inspection of factories is meant to cover inspection of septic-tank installations. The answer is that the charge is a medical charge, and that it will be met from the Medical Budget.

"The Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari has drawn attention to the claims of the Provincial Educational Service. These were the subject of a careful inquiry by Mr. Earle, and last year proposals were submitted to the Government of India for the improvement of the pay and prospects of the Service. Government recognizes that the result of its action is eagerly awaited by the public generally, and especially by those interested in the progress of education.

"Three of the Hon'ble Members have complained that there is a disproportionate expenditure on the work of inspection of schools compared with the work of teaching. It is true that the cost of inspection has increased nearly three-fold in six years, but is still only 13 per cent. of the total Educational Budget. Leeway had to be made up under both heads, and we have now practically completed the scheme which we had for the improvement of inspection. The scheme for the improvement of secondary education at a recurring cost of many lakhs, which is a much larger matter, is still under

[Mr. Cumming.]

discussion with the Government of India, who have quite recently approved generally of the principles of our scheme. The scheme for guru-training schools is for the improvement of teaching in primary schools.

"The Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari has emphasized the difficulty and expense of bringing our colleges up to a proper University standard. Government appreciates the propriety of setting a good example in Government colleges and of giving assistance to private colleges. From time to time temporary appointments have been made in Government colleges on the lines of the permanent appointments proposed in Mr. Earle's scheme. It is a question of funds. In response to our request to the Government of India to continue the allotment of liberal grants for the improvement of private colleges and for University reform generally, including University buildings, a sum of Rs. 1,60,000 has been allotted to this Province, after the present budget was framed; the details are not yet in our hands. We have recently passed orders on the recommendation of Mr. Kuehler, until recently the Director of Public Instruction, for an increase of staff in the Sanskrit College and in the Patna College; and proposals for strengthening the staff of the Ravenshaw College and for giving further assistance to the Bihar National College are under consideration. The Hon'ble the Nawab Bahadur of Murshidabad has drawn attention to the need for the improvement of the Calcutta Madrassa. Mr. Earle, when on special duty in 1908, drew up a scheme in consultation with a representative Committee. His proposals were nearly all accepted by Government, and are to be brought into effect as funds permit. The sum of Rs. 9,000 now allotted represents two-thirds of the amount which is required. The Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan and the Hon'ble Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur have called attention to the scheme for an Arts College at Ranchi. Government shares the regret of the Hon'ble Members that the condition laid down by the Government of India antecedent to the acceptance by this Government of the generous offer of one lakh made by the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan and his friends, has not been fulfilled; but there is no danger that the scheme will be overlooked.

"Turning to the head of Technical Education, I may say in reply to the Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari that the proposed removal of the Civil Engineering College from Sibpur has been accepted in principle by the Government of India. The Engineering College in all probability will continue to develop as it has done in the past. Two of the main proposals mentioned in the Industrial Report are no longer in the hands of this Government. As regards instruction in Industrial Chemistry, the arrangements have been made, and we await the arrival of an expert whose selection is at present in the hands of the Secretary of State. Government desires some experience of these Industrial Chemistry classes before embarking on a larger scheme. The appointment of a Superintendent of Industries and Inspector of Technical and Industrial Schools is also before the Secretary of State. The Weaving Institute at Serampore was opened in January last; the future careers of those who are trained there will be watched with interest.

"The Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari has complained that the Law College grant is too small. This Government has sanctioned an annual grant of Rs. 3,500 for five years to the University Law College. The Patna Law College will require in its first year more than the Rs. 20,000 entered in the Budget, especially on account of the Library, and an endeavour will be made by Government to make up the deficiency. As regards law scholarships for Uriya students, six at Rs. 30 a month have been sanctioned, tenable at Patna or Calcutta. I regret to have to inform the Hon'ble Mr. Das that for the present, a separate Law College for Orissa is not justified, though Government sympathizes with the wish of Uriyas to study for the B. L. Examination without leaving Orissa. And as regards the training and examination in Surveying of pleaders, this matter has been under the examination of this Government in consultation with the Hon'ble the Judges of the High Court and with the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam. It is proposed to constitute a representative Board which would conduct examinations for the two provinces. Improved arrangements have also been made for imparting instruction in Surveying.

[Mr. Cumming ; Mr. Duke.]

“The Hon’ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari has noticed the omission of any grant to the private Schools of Art in Calcutta. These must, I am afraid, look to the public for assistance.

“The Hon’ble Mr. Das is under the impression that the fact that the District Boards did not appropriate all the grants for primary schools shows that there was an inability on the part of the people to comply with the terms of the grants, and he suggests an alteration of the terms. This is not the whole reason; the District Boards were asked in the latter half of the year to refund unexpended balances to meet other claims in the Department on account of primary education. The grants were for building model primary schools; and in many cases local contributions were not forthcoming. Government is not prepared on the experience gained to dispense with the local contribution.

“The same Hon’ble Member has put forward a representation for the training of female teachers in Orissa. Government in this matter, after careful consideration, has made a modest experimental start in Calcutta and in Patna. The case of Orissa will now be considered.

“In conclusion, Sir, there is one remark of the Hon’ble Mr. Das which I cannot allow to pass unchallenged: he suggests that Magistrates take a pleasure in disturbing on unintelligible grounds the harmonious working of girls’ schools. The experience of the Hon’ble Member may have been unfortunate: but as a general statement for the whole Province, it is hardly fair, and does not agree with anything which I have ever heard or seen in district work.”

The Hon’ble MR. DUKE said:—“SIR—The Hon’ble Babu Radha Charan Pal refers to the provision of Rs. 50,000 which has been made for Additional Deputy Collectors for settlement duty, and expresses the hope that this will be so utilized as to reduce the period of probation of Deputy and Sub-Deputy Collectors. These gentlemen, as he observes, were formerly kept on probation for a period of six months, which has recently been extended to a year, during which period they receive a subsistence allowance, which is only half of the pay which they draw when finally appointed *sub. pro tem.* The extension of probation to a year took place after mature consideration, because young officers on their appointment have everything to learn; and unless they are given special training, they fail to obtain a comprehensive knowledge of their duties. After their year’s probation, they are given appointments as fast as vacancies occur; and the only way to appoint them quicker, would be to recruit fewer of them, which, perhaps, the Hon’ble Member would not desire. The special provision of Rs. 50,000 is intended to provide for 10 Deputy Collectors and 30 Sub-Deputy Collectors; but these appointments can only be made when the Government of India sanction them. Should the Government of India do so, the officers at present on probation would, no doubt, benefit by, in the first instance, obtaining a majority of the new appointments.

“Reference has been made by the Hon’ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari to the scale of travelling allowance granted to Sub-Deputy Collectors. The Government of India at one time, about two years ago, allowed a daily rate of Rs. 3 to be drawn by Sub-Deputy Collectors, but a short time after they withdrew the privilege and confined them to the ordinary rates of travelling allowance under the Civil Service Regulations. It must, however, be remembered that previous to 1907 Sub-Deputy Collectors drew no daily allowance, unless they travelled more than 15 miles a day. Now they draw it on the same conditions as other officers of similar standing. Under the rules they are entitled to from Re. 1 to Rs. 2-8, according to their rate of pay. So far Government has not before it sufficient materials to lead it to suppose this rate to be inadequate to meet their ordinary expenses.

“The question of the scheme of the separation of Executive and Judicial functions which has been referred to by the Hon’ble Babu Radha Charan Pal has not lain dormant. It has, however, become apparent that there are extensive difficulties, both legal and practical, and these are being solved in correspondence with the Government of India. If the solution should be satisfactory, extensive measures of preparation will still be required to give effect to the scheme, and expenditure on it could hardly be undertaken in the current year, even if the financial situation permitted.

[Mr. Duke.]

"Referring to the observations of the Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal on the necessity for improving the Calcutta Police Court building, I can only regret that improvement is blocked for the present by financial stringency. My predecessor, Mr. Gait, promised last year that, if the Chief Presidency Magistrate could suggest improvements on a reasonable scale, the matter would be sympathetically considered. These proposals have not yet been submitted in a form in which they can be dealt with by Government. But even if they had been, it must be admitted that funds could not be found to undertake them in the current year.

"Referring to the remarks made by the Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal and other Hon'ble Members on Fraserganj, I would desire to correct the misapprehension, if in fact it exists, that Fraserganj was intended solely or even mainly as a health resort. The opportunity for establishing a health resort arose, because the island under reclamation had a sea frontage. Efforts were certainly made to popularise it by providing a rest bungalow and a golf course and by establishing a steamer service. These, however, only account for a total of rather less than Rs. 80,000 out of about Rs. 5,30,000 which was expended on the reclamation. The efforts have not been successful, owing to the difficulty of maintaining a steamer service and the future of the island as a health resort mainly depends on whether such a service can be run. For the present no further expenditure will be incurred in this direction. The remaining expenditure of 4½ lakhs is due to the reclamation of land for cultivation—an enterprise in which Government has not previously embarked on its own account, at least on such a scale but one, as the Council is aware, which has been extensively carried on by private capitalists in the Sundarbans.

"Upwards of 7,000 acres have been reclaimed and rendered fit for cultivation. Expenditure has practically come to an end, except, of course, on the recurring repairs to embankments. It is improbable that Government will continue to directly manage the reclaimed estate, and proposals for leasing it are under consideration.

"The Hon'ble Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur has suggested that provision should have been made for a larger number of itinerant Agricultural Inspectors. The itinerant Inspector shown in the Budget is a Provincial officer: he may be employed for the inspection of the Government farms, and suffices for that duty. As demonstration farms are multiplied, it will be necessary to employ other Inspectors. The Hon'ble Member may, however, be reminded that there are already six Agricultural Inspectors employed in Divisions under the Divisional Associations, as also three travelling Overseers, although these officers are of a lower rank than the Inspectors of the Provincial Service to whom the Hon'ble Member refers, and their business lies rather in advising members of the local Associations as to improvements in cultivation and in supervising district and private demonstration farms, and explaining their working to members of Associations and to the public. The facts however show that adequate steps have been taken to provide an inspecting agency intended to keep the department in touch with the public.

"I have to refer to the Fisheries inquiry, for which the allotment stands at Rs. 1,65,000, on which some observations have been made by the Hon'ble Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur and the Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.

"I would note first that about half the expense is occasioned by the *Golden Crown*. Regarding the operations of this vessel, there appears to be a certain amount of misconception. Attention has been directed to the fact that she is of antiquated type, and less efficient than the most modern builds of trawlers, particularly in being able to shoot her nets only on one side. The misconception consists in supposing that Government would attempt in an experiment limited as to scope and time to prove by actual results that deep sea fishing pays. What has been attempted, is to ascertain what fish there are in the Bay, where they are to be found at particular seasons, whether they are acceptable to the market, and in what quantities they can be caught. If it were merely desired to show what could be made out of fishing, we should, of course, stick to the nearest rich ground, fish it as hard as possible, and try to show how much could be got from it. What has been done, is quite different, namely, to search the Bay up and down, trawling in every part of it

[*Mr. Duke.*]

where trawling is possible, and to chart and record the results. When this has been done for one or two seasons (it was proposed originally to carry on the experiment for about 18 months in all, but as a matter of fact our information is already, perhaps, sufficiently complete, as far as the Bengal portion of the waters is concerned, and it may be possible to sell, or at any rate to pay off, the trawler a good deal earlier), the public will have complete information as to the fish of the Bay, and the quantity which can be taken at a single haul. It will then rest with those who have the capital and enterprise to devise the best type of vessel for Indian waters, the way in which she should be manned, and the most economical manner of bringing the fish to market.

“Should the Fishery inquiry be further proceeded with, it will be in other and much less expensive directions, namely, as to the breeding and conservation of various types of fresh water fish, the improvement of curing and salting, the utilisation of bye-products.

“The Hon’ble the Maharajadhiraja of Burdwan complains of a tendency which he observes to interfere with private rights. I think that any apprehension as to harassing or irritating interference by Government might have been relieved by the mere fact that some tentative suggestions for restrictions on the wholesale depletion of fish in running rivers were first of all submitted to the Fishery Board for their opinion. It must also be remembered that if Mr. Gupta’s inquiry proved anything, it was that to the unrestrained and reckless slaughter of fish of all kinds and all ages is due the very inferior condition of inland fisheries at this day; and that if a better return is to be obtained by fishermen and fishery-owners, it can only be by submitting to some degree of restraint and regulation as to the manner and the seasons in which the fish are killed. What such regulations should be is the function of this inquiry to determine; and whether they can be made acceptable to the people, is that of the Fishery Board.

“The Hon’ble Mr. Das also refers to some encroachment by Government on private fishery rights in Orissa. I am ignorant to what particular circumstances he refers, but I can declare with absolute assurance that Government has no more idea of attempting to deprive individuals of their rights in fisheries than of their lands and houses.

“I have listened with interest to the Hon’ble Mr. Das’s observations on the desirability of increasing occupation in industrial pursuits, and reducing the pressure of the cultivating classes on the land. I believe that the Council will unanimously sympathise with Mr. Das’s view, that the best hopes for improving the condition of the general body of the people lie in multiplying industrial occupations. But beyond this I can hardly follow him. When distress is upon us, we must employ the people in a manner which will give the most immediate relief, and at other times there is no Famine-relief Fund on which we can operate. Government has already made efforts in various directions to improve instruction in handicrafts by starting technical schools, and recently by establishing weaving schools. Improvement in this direction must, however, operate by the gradual withdrawal of a portion of the population from agricultural to industrial pursuits. This will inevitably occur when they find that skill in such pursuits is rewarded by a superior livelihood. If advantage were taken of a famine to force people into avocations repugnant to their caste feeling, the result would probably be the very opposite of what the Hon’ble Member contemplates, and the occupation forcibly adopted would become the most signal badge of degradation.

“The Hon’ble Babu Gajadhar Prasad’s observations on the necessity of preservation of forests deserve serious consideration. It has been impressed on Government with increasing force that the forests of the country which are outside the operation of the forest laws are becoming so depleted that they can no longer supply local requirements.

“Over and above that it is now, as the Hon’ble Member says, a generally accepted theory that forest denudation prejudicially affects the rainfall.

“If this view is gaining acceptance with the public, it may become possible to act; but hitherto the great obstacle to Government action has been the objection to any interference with private rights. If it becomes impressed on the public that these rights may soon become valueless owing to total exhaustion, Government may receive some support for conservative action. A Committee has already been examining the forest tracts in the west and south

[Mr. Duke ; Mr. Macpherson.]

of the Province, and has made suggestions as to how the benefits of the forests may be secured to future generations of those entitled to them. These are under consideration at present, and meantime it may be hoped that public opinion on the subject will be gradually educated."

The Hon'ble MR. MACPHERSON said:—"I wish to offer some remarks with regard to the check in the growth of the Excise revenue of the Province which Hon'ble Members will have noticed but which has not, I think, been commented on. And if my remarks relate chiefly to revenue figures I hope that they will not be misunderstood to indicate that revenue is the chief subject of solicitude in excise administration.

"The principles of excise administration in India have been thoroughly discussed in recent years, at least with regard to the liquor traffic, in the Indian Excise Committee's Report and in the Government Resolutions published thereon. A Bill to amend the Bengal Excise Act is now before the Council. It has been circulated for public criticism, and the opinions received will be carefully considered by the Select Committee before the Council next meets. I hope to be excused, therefore, if, in this budget discussion, I confine myself chiefly to aspects of revenue.

"For nearly 20 years up to and including the year 1907-08 there has been a continuous increase of the Excise revenue broken only by a shrinkage of 6 lakhs in the receipts of the famine year 1897-98. During the five years ending 1907-08 there was an average annual increase of nearly 8 lakhs. A year ago, therefore, it appeared to be reasonable to estimate that the excise revenue of 1908-09 would amount to 175 lakhs, or $4\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs in excess of 1907-08. This expectation, however, has not been realised and the Excise Commissioner's latest estimate of the total excise revenue of the Province for the year 1908-09 is that it has not exceeded 170 or 171 lakhs, i.e., he reckons that it has been practically the same as that of 1907-08.

"It is believed that there has been no falling off in the revenue from drugs. It is under the head of country spirit that the revenue has diminished or remained stationary in important areas. I may remark that the revenue from country spirit is about 94 lakhs, or considerably more than half of the whole Excise revenue.

"The still-head duty on the country spirit was raised during the year in 11 districts, so the decrease of revenue in contract and central distillery districts was the result of diminished drinking. The causes of decreased consumption and decreased revenue will be analysed in the administration report for the year. But there can be little doubt that a main cause of decreased consumption is to be found in the high price of food-grains, which diminished the purchasing power of consumers. Such a decrease of consumption of country-spirit is a well known feature of a time of serious scarcity or high price of food-grains in this Province. And it is a satisfactory feature of hard times as showing self-restraint and self-denial.

"In Calcutta a large decrease in consumption of country-spirit is attributed to the increase of the duty, the reduction of issue strengths and the abolition of a number of shops—measures which were ordered by Government on the recommendation of the Committee which sat in Calcutta last year. It has been suggested on the other hand, that there has been an increase in consumption of imported liquors in Calcutta, but this suggestion has not been verified, and it may be mentioned that the number of licenses in Calcutta for sale of imported liquor, subsidiary to country spirit licenses, has been reduced from 94 to 60.

"In some of the Bihar and Chota Nagpur districts the failure of the *mohua* crop made reduction of out-still fees necessary last year.

"Complete figures for the new excise settlements are not yet available, but in the circumstances with which the new financial year has begun it appears to me that the estimate of 179 lakhs for the Excise revenue of 1909-10 has been pitched too high; and perhaps an estimate of 175 lakhs will be sufficiently sanguine.

"The Hon'ble Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur, suggests that an inquiry should be made to see if a revival of the system of allowing discount to stamp

[Mr. Macpherson ; Mr. Slacke.]

vendors on the sale of one-anna and half-anna unified stamps would conduce to the public convenience.

“The discount formerly allowed on sale of such stamps was stopped under the orders of the Government of India two year's ago. It was at the same time ordered that postal officers and licensed vendors of general stamps should always be required to keep a week's supply of one-anna and half-anna stamps for sale to the public. If stamp vendors do not conform to this rule, complaint should be made to the Collector of the district. The stamp vendors naturally grumbled two year's ago when they were deprived of their discount but the Board have not heard, I think, of any complaint made during the last two years by the public and no inquiry on the subject appears to be necessary ”

The Hon'ble Mr. SLACKE said :—“Your Honour—The Hon'ble Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur has asked whether Government is satisfied that the work done by the Controller of Office Systems is commensurate with the expense incurred on that account. Briefly put, his duties are to see that record-rooms are properly maintained, that the expenditure on forms and stationery is kept within due limits, and later on he will organize and supervise schools for the training of those who have been selected as probationary ministerial officers.

“That officer works directly under me, and I have no reason to think that the work he has done and is doing for Government and the High Court is not commensurate with the expense incurred.

“Concerning water-lifting machinery and its usefulness for irrigation, leave was given this last cold weather to make an experiment in Bihar, but sufficient time has not yet passed to enable me to form any idea of the value to be attached to the method employed.

“Turning to the remarks which the Hon'ble Mr. Das has made about the revision-settlement work now in progress in Orissa, I have been unable to find any authority for the assertion that the main object of the work in question is to reduce the costs of the next revenue settlement revision in Orissa.

“What were the objects of the revision work were clearly explained in the letter which was circulated last year to the Orissa Association with the draft Maintenance of Records Bill.

“The Hon'ble Member has urged that the revision work may be delayed and spread over a longer period than is at present contemplated. But the information at my disposal shows that the vast majority of the people of Orissa, viz., the tenants, neither wish for delay nor regard the work with other than friendly feelings, as they recognize the necessity of having their rights protected from oppressive zamindars. I would, with your permission, Sir, read the following extract from the last yearly report of the Director of Land Records :—

“The Settlement Officer writes as follows on this subject :—

‘A large number of zamindars still regard the operations with some disfavour, specially those who are oppressive or grasping. The revision is on the other hand evidently welcomed by the tenants for the reasons given in the Director's Annual Report last year. This was strikingly shown during the past season's khanapuri operations in Outtaak. I have previously described how we were forced to select special areas in Outtaak in order that unnecessary harassment should not be caused to tenants holding lands in the flooded tracts. Thus in thana Tirtol certain areas in which considerable losses had occurred were excluded. When Mr. James, the Assistant Settlement Officer in charge, was inspecting the work in the adjoining protected area, a large number of tenants from the flooded portion came to him and begged that operations should start at once in their tract. They went so far as to deny loss of crops, and thereby ran the risk of losing the taccavi advances sanctioned by the Collector. The Chakla Kanungo happened to be with Mr. James at the time, and assured him there had been serious loss of crop and the latter did not therefore accede to the tenants' request.

‘From time to time paragraphs appear in various papers purporting to be reports of meetings of landlords and tenants protesting against the revision operations. There is little doubt that the writers of these reports are entirely influenced by the landlord.’

“The Hon'ble Member, in making the request for delay, loses sight of the fact that delay will render the work more expensive, and as the requisite funds

[*Mr. Slacks ; Mr. Oldham.*]

are provided from Provincial Revenues, further delay would lessen the resources available to Government for expenditure on other objects, and so would prevent Government rendering that assistance to education which the Hon'ble Member desires.

"Nor can I support the Hon'ble Member's plea for delay on the ground that the recasting of the local land law is under contemplation. It was the revision work that brought to light facts tending to show the need for remodeling the law. But even if it is decided to re-cast the law, such will not affect the essential portions of the record."

The Hon'ble MR. OLDHAM said :—"There is one feature, Sir, of the debate to-day which must, I think, have met with the warm approval of the great majority of the Members of this Council. I refer to the comparative brevity of the speeches, and the more concise manner in which on the whole their criticisms have been formulated by the non-official Members, which is due no doubt to the advice given by Your Honour at the last meeting. It is not a fact, as complained by one Hon'ble Member, that they have been in any way restrained from criticising the administration of the Province: it has merely been very properly pointed out that such criticisms should be confined to matters relevant to this Council, and be expressed at reasonable length. The result has been not only to expedite the proceedings of the Council to-day, but also to materially assist the official Members in their task of collecting the information required to enable them to reply to the various points raised. It will be agreed, I think, that the criticisms of the Hon'ble Members have gained in force by being more concisely expressed. Most of the questions raised have already been answered by the Hon'ble Members of the Board, etc., and my colleagues. There remain a few subjects which relate more particularly to the Departments under the Financial Secretary, and a few remarks regarding the form and contents of the Financial Statement itself, and the procedure of discussion, to which with your permission, Sir, I propose to refer.

"Before doing so, however, I would like to thank the Hon'ble Members for the sympathetic spirit in which they have received what is, for unavoidable reasons, a deficit budget, and for the general approval, which is shown by the few objections raised, of the manner in which we have decided to distribute the limited funds at our disposal. A Financial Secretary without a surplus to dispose of is like the mariner of old steering between Scylla and Charybdis. On the one hand, he has to face continually the displeasure of energetic and zealous Heads of Departments anxious to push forward schemes of development and improvement. He is regarded as an obstructionist and a miser because he is constantly cutting down expenditure. On the other hand, he has to endure the reproaches of Hon'ble Members because he does not provide for largely increased expenditure under other heads in which they are more particularly interested: he does not fulfil their ideal of a successful Financial Secretary who should distribute liberal grants from a large surplus. He is in fact nobody's friend.

"There are a few references to the form of the statement which call for notice. The Hon'ble Member who represents the University and the Hon'ble Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur are not yet satisfied with the amount of information supplied to enable Hon'ble Members to criticise the Budget. All I can say is that more information has been given than was ever supplied before; and I have done what was possible to meet the requests made by Hon'ble Members in this respect last year. During the last three years, moreover, unofficial meetings have been held beforehand, so as to enable the non-official Members to obtain any information they wanted, and that could be reasonably given. I have noticed, however, that even when full explanations have been given and information supplied at these unofficial meetings, exactly the same questions and demands for information are afterwards made in this Council.

"The Hon'ble Babu Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur asks for information to show to what extent allotments made for useful public purposes in a year have not been wholly or partially utilised during the year, together with explanations showing how far the unexecuted portions of such works are covered by

[*Mr. Oldham.*]

re-grants in succeeding years. The Hon'ble Member cannot realise what an expenditure of time and labour it would involve to give this information in respect of every single work. In the case of grants made to local bodies, we have not got the information. If the Hon'ble Member would apply in respect of any specific work or works, Government would gladly obtain the information for him; but it is wholly outside the scope of the Financial Statement to provide details of this nature. Under the head 'Civil Works,' the most important items only are separately mentioned in the Financial Statement. If the Hon'ble Member had asked me for a copy of the complete list prepared in the Public Works Department, I am sure the Hon'ble Mr. Thomson would have gladly supplied it. In paragraph 95 of the Financial Statement referred to by the Hon'ble Member, the works mentioned are works that are being carried out by the Public Works Department. Petty works of construction and repairs which are not executed by the Public Works Department, are shown under the departmental heads. The provision in the Education budget for improvements at the Presidency College, the Sanskrit College and the Calcutta Madrassa are not for buildings but for improvements in laboratories, etc., and for additional staff and establishment. The provision of 2 lakhs for Guru-training schools, similarly, is not shown under Civil Works in charge of the Public Works Department, but under the departmental head 'Education,' as the school buildings in question are not being constructed by the Public Works Department officers, but under the supervision of officers of the Education Department.

"The Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal suggests that, to permit of useful discussions on the Budget, a monthly statement of the progress of expenditure and revenue by minor heads with explanation of any increase or decrease under each head as well as an appropriation report should be prepared and circulated to the Members. Even the Local Government does not receive such explanations. It would be quite impracticable to supply them to Members. The Accountant-General, Bengal, sends in manuscript to Government some five or six weeks after the close of the month to which the figures relate a monthly consolidated abstract of (a) receipts, and (b) expenditure, comparing the figures with those of the previous year. No explanations of increases or decreases are given in these abstracts; nor would it be possible without incommensurate labour to supply such explanations. An appropriation report on the civil accounts is received by Government about seven months after the close of the year. This report, however, does not show Provincial figures separately. Neither of these sets of accounts shows final figures. It has recently been decided that copies of the annual Appropriation Report will be sent to Hon'ble Members on their applying for them.

"The Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari appears to be still under a misapprehension in regard to the grant of 50 lakhs for the Calcutta Improvement Scheme. He has spoken of this sum being 'unwarrantably treated as part of the supposed-to-be-available cash balance' and has said that part of it has been 'swept away along with the general balance,' etc., etc. In the consideration of our own financial position, this grant has always been left out of account, as has been repeatedly explained in this Council. If this money had been available for re-appropriation, there would have been no necessity for moving the Government of India for a special grant. What happened was that we overdraw our balance to the extent of about 8 lakhs only. The Government of India had in the middle of last year specially authorised us to overdraw our balance, as they recognised that the conditions of the year were extraordinary and that it was inevitable that we should overdraw. Perhaps the Hon'ble Member may understand the position if I speak of the Improvement Trust grant as a fixed deposit, and of our ordinary account as a current deposit account. We overdraw our current deposit account with the Government of India, with their permission and approval: we did not withdraw our fixed deposit. The Government of India have declined on principle to allow the 50 lakhs grant to be placed out at interest, and whether times be good or bad they will not consent to this being done.

"The Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal speaks of a deficit in the current budget of nearly 17 lakhs. If he will look at the Financial Statement,

[Mr. Oldham.]

however, he will see that the deficit is Rs. 8,77,000. The same Member has made some comments on the estimate of receipts under the head Stamps and Excise. He points out that during the last five years the average increase of revenue under the head of Stamps has been about 4½ lakhs a year; but in this estimate he has included the year 1908-09 when the receipts were abnormally low. If he will look at the figures for the four years 1904-05 to 1907-08, he will find that the average increase during those years was a little over 7 lakhs per annum. The receipts during 1908-09 were admittedly abnormal. We expect, therefore, that during the current year there will be more than the normal increase as compared with the actuals of 1908-09. In other words, taking the two years 1908-09 and 1909-10 together we have estimated for a total increase during the two years of Rs. 9,12,000, as against an average increase of Rs. 14,00,000 during each of the two preceding two-year periods. If the figures for Excise receipts are looked at in the same way, it will be clear that the estimate for the current year is justified by previous actuals.

“The same Hon'ble Member is correct in thinking that some provisional relief has been afforded to ministerial officers in anticipation of the final orders of the Secretary of State on the recommendations made by the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee. The scale of salaries has been revised with special reference to the increased cost of living, so as to give substantial relief to this indispensable class of officers. The proposals in question have been submitted by the Government of India to the Secretary of State; and this Government hopes that there will be little further delay in giving full effect to them.

“The Hon'ble the Nawab Bahadur of Murshidabad and the Hon'ble Mr. Larmour have referred to the useful improvements that have been carried out at the Campbell Hospital, and the latter Member suggests that measures should be taken to increase the permanent accommodation for small-pox patients at that hospital and also to construct another small-pox hospital in the north of the city. The existing ward for small-pox patients at the Campbell Hospital has recently been enlarged and improved at a cost of Rs. 42,000. Owing to the large influx of patients due to the present unprecedentedly severe epidemic, temporary sheds have also been erected in the compound, and the plague ward is also being used for small-pox patients. Plans are now ready for a project which will largely increase the permanent accommodation at this hospital in more suitable buildings; and the work will be taken up as soon as funds can be provided. But the work cannot be put in hand until the present epidemic subsides, as some existing buildings have first to be removed. To meet the present emergency, steps were taken six weeks ago, in consultation with the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, Major Vaughan, the Chairman and the Health Officer of the Corporation, to arrange for the construction of a temporary hospital at Tiljala at an estimated cost of Rs. 16,000, the charges being met by Government and the Corporation in equal shares. The necessity for a second permanent hospital for the northern portion of the city will receive due consideration, in consultation with the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals and the Medical Department of the Calcutta Corporation.

“In reference to Mr. Larmour's suggestion for legislation to prevent people travelling by rail who are known to be suffering from small-pox, I may mention that section 71 of the Indian Railways Act already provides for the case; and this section has been used in respect of persons suffering from plague.

“Three of the Hon'ble Members have referred to the question of measures for the prevention of malaria. This subject has received the constant attention of Government. At the last meeting of Council, I referred to the measures that were being taken for extending and popularising the use of quinine. One of the proposals made by the Drainage Committee was that a systematic inquiry should be made during the fever season into the prevalence of malaria, and as to the extent to which deaths reported from fever are in reality due to malaria and the conditions governing the distribution of the disease. Our proposals to give effect to these recommendations were accepted by the Government of India, and Captain W. H. C. Foster, I.M.S., an officer with special qualifications for this kind of work, was placed on special duty

[*Mr. Oldham.*]

in July last with two Assistant Surgeons and six Hospital Assistants, to carry out such an inquiry. The period of Captain Foster's deputation expired on the 31st of March; and his report will be received almost immediately. Besides this measure, 17 itinerant Civil Hospital Assistants were deputed in June last to certain specified areas most infected with malaria in the districts of Murshidabad, Nadia, Khulna, Jessore and the 24 Parganas, to distribute medical aid to the people free of charge during the fever season. A report has recently been received from the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals which shows that these operations have been a success, and that the services of the Civil Hospital Assistants have been much appreciated by the people. The anti-malarial operations started in previous years were continued in the town of Ranaghat and in the North Barrackpore Municipality. In both cases the Sanitary Commissioner has been able to report that some success has been attained. Such operations are, however, even in small limited areas like these, very expensive, and it is clearly impracticable that they should be adopted all over the Province. The question of creating a special Engineering Division for the purpose of examining drainage conditions and preparing projects for the improvement of drainage is still under correspondence with the Government of India. Jungle clearing is a matter for the local authorities to deal with, and does not call for special grants from Government.

"The Hon'ble Babu Radha Charan Pal refers to the question of septic tanks. The Inspector of Factories for whom the provision referred to provides, is the Inspector appointed under the Factories Act, and has nothing to do with the inspection of the septic tank installations. Government has decided, however, to appoint an Inspector of Septic Tank Installations, with a view to their more efficient working. In regard to the question of the contamination of the water of the Hooghly by the effluents, the Hon'ble Member is referred to the deliberations of the Committee that sat a little more than four years ago when Mr. Shirres was Secretary, to the conclusions of that Committee and to the orders of Government thereon. The Lieutenant-Governor then came to the conclusion that if certain conditions were complied with, there would no longer be any sanitary ground for opposing these installations. The whole subject, which is one of considerable difficulty, has again recently been under the consideration of Government, as I have already informed the Hon'ble Member. I also told him that I would be very pleased to show him all the correspondence and notes on the subject. But he has not availed of my offer. The Lieutenant-Governor contemplates appointing a small representative committee, on which the Mills as well as the Hindu population will be represented, to consider the most suitable method of dealing with the effluents. The Hon'ble Member makes a very serious allegation when he says that since the effluents have been discharged into the Hooghly the health of the population of these tracts has suffered. Such statements as this are likely to give rise to grave misunderstanding, and I think the Council will agree with me that they should not be made without full inquiry and consideration. The Sanitary Commissioner, who has been consulted by me, reports, on the contrary, that the general health of the riparian towns affected by the septic tank installations has considerably improved during the five years 1904-1908 as compared with the preceding five years 1899-1903, both on the Calcutta and on the Howrah side of the river. The mortality figures for the towns on the Calcutta side show a death-rate of 27.45 per mille as compared with 34.70 per mille; and the figures for the towns on the Howrah side, a death-rate of 36.85 as compared with 41.32.

"The Hon'ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari refers to 'hopes held out' last year of bettering the status of the Assistant Surgeons' service. What I said last year was that memorials had been received from certain Assistant Surgeons 3 or 4 days before the Budget discussion, and that they would receive full consideration at the hands of Government. This consideration was given, and proposals were submitted to the Government of India in May last, recommending certain improvements in the pay and prospects of these officers. The Government of India, however, have not been able to accept

[Mr. Oldham.]

our proposals. They have suggested a different way of dealing with the problem; and the whole question is now under discussion.

“The Hon’ble Babu Radha Charan Pal has suggested Diamond Harbour as an excellent place for a sanitarium such as the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan has in view. The Hon’ble Member seems to have taken a particular fancy to Diamond Harbour, as he has referred to it for three years running as a desirable Health Resort. The scheme of the establishment of a sanitarium for the poorer classes, as sketched out by the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, has been referred to a special committee. I have been advised that Diamond Harbour would not be a suitable place for the kind of sanitarium intended. So far the choice has fallen upon Simultala. But it will be a long time before the scheme can be given effect to.

“The Hon’ble Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari complains that the grants made by Government towards the Puri Drainage and Water-works scheme are insufficient. He says that the sanitation of important places of pilgrimage and health resorts like this ought to be a matter of Government concern. I consider this a most unreasonable complaint. Government has a year ago given a grant of $\frac{2}{3}$ ths of a lakh towards the Drainage scheme, and has already, last year, paid one lakh towards the Water-works scheme, that is to say, in two years $1\frac{1}{3}$ lakhs have been given to this town alone, while hope has been held out of further assistance. This is, so far as I know, unprecedented generosity towards any one town; and on the face of it, it is surely conclusive evidence that Government regards the sanitation of the place as a matter of concern.

“The Hon’ble Mr. Graham has referred to the remarkable disparity between the total of the subscriptions from the European community and from the Indian communities towards the cost of the nursing arrangements at the two large hospitals in this city. Government has already referred to this matter in its Resolution of the 5th February on the report of the Nursing Arrangements Committee. The figures given in the Resolution for the three years 1905 to 1907 show that the proportion of subscriptions from the different communities is as stated by the Hon’ble Member. It has also been pointed out that in the Medical College and connected hospitals more than two-thirds of the patients are Indians. The Lieutenant-Governor has already expressed the hope that the Indian communities will heartily respond to an appeal for further subscriptions. It is understood that the General Committee of the Calcutta Hospital Nurses’ Institute are taking steps to make a systematic appeal in this direction.

“Then there comes the Hon’ble Mr. Das’ question in regard to feeder roads. The allotment of 2 lakhs is for feeder roads in all parts of the Province. It is a lump allotment, and no portion has yet been distributed. When the local officers require grants, they apply to Government: this provision is made to meet such applications.

“For the Hon’ble Mr. Larmour’s information I may say that a draft Bill to give effect to the proposals for an Improvement Scheme for Calcutta was drawn up by this Government last year. The fact that it contained 191 clauses should satisfy the Hon’ble Member that it is a subject that cannot be disposed of with much haste.

“It is very gratifying to Government to hear from the lips of the Hon’ble Babu Gajadhar Prasad of the general satisfaction with which the recent orders in regard to the selection of the sites for liquor shops have been received by the public.

“When presenting the Financial Statement, I fully explained the untoward causes that had combined to deplete the Provincial balance. I am afraid from certain remarks that have fallen to-day, one or two of the Hon’ble Members have failed to understand those reasons. On that occasion I took the period of four years, 1906-07 to 1909-10, and I showed that within this period, owing to extraordinary circumstances, unforeseen charges for which no provision had been made in the Provincial Settlement, aggregating a little over 60 lakhs of rupees, had fallen upon our revenues; and I showed that this more than accounted for the depletion in the balance. Perhaps it will make it simpler for the Hon’ble Members if I confine attention to two years only, viz., 1908-09 and 1909-10. At the close of 1907-08 we had a balance of $21\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs. (I omit the 50 lakhs grant for the Calcutta Improvement Scheme altogether.) This is,

[Mr. Oldham ; the President.]

therefore, what we started the year 1908-09 with. The Government of India have also given us an additional grant of Rs. 16,95,000. This makes a total, say, of 38½ lakhs. Now, during the past year and the current year (taking the budget estimate as our guide for the current year) we shall have had to incur unforeseen and extraordinary charges that were not anticipated at the time of the last settlement, amounting to some 40½ lakhs. I shall explain what these are—Firstly there is the grain-compensation allowance which, we estimate, will amount to 10½ lakhs in 1908-09 and 9½ lakhs in 1909-10, or a total of 20 lakhs in the two years. Secondly, there are the charges for the relief of famine and distress, amounting to Rs. 2,62,000 in 1908-09 and Rs. 9,14,000 in 1909-10, or a total of Rs. 11,76,000. Thirdly, there are the extraordinary law charges and charges under Police and Jails due to the outbreak of anarchism and sedition which, during the year 1908-09 alone, I now estimate, will amount to 8½ or 9 lakhs. In addition to these extraordinary charges, we are confronted with an extraordinary loss of revenue under the heads Land-revenue, Stamps and Excise, aggregating 5½ lakhs. The grand total of unforeseen charges and loss of revenue during this period will, therefore, amount to nearly 46 lakhs, as compared with the reduction in the balance of 38½ lakhs. I do not think I can make these figures clearer. On the other hand, I think I may justly say that in these two years there has been no unnecessary expenditure permitted under any heads except perhaps for the Fisheries Inquiry and the grants given to local bodies to help them with various schemes of water-supply, sanitation, etc., such as 1¾ lakhs given to Puri, which, however, the Hon'ble Member opposite not only regards as legitimate but also wishes us to regard as inadequate.

“From the Financial Secretary's point of view, such complaints as have been heard to-day fall, broadly speaking, under two heads:—

- (1) that the non-official Members of Council have insufficient opportunities of criticising the details of the budget and of helping to shape it before it finds its final form as passed by the Government of India; and
- (2) that there will be no balance at the end of the year.

In regard to the first head, we expect, Sir, that before the next Financial Statement is presented to this Council, the new Reform scheme will have come into force, and the new principles and details of budget discussion been introduced; and these, it is hoped, will leave nothing further to be desired by the keenest Member. In regard to the second head, I can only say that we all pray that the monsoon rains may be full and seasonable; that trade and commerce may briskly revive; and that the foul disease of anarchism and sedition may be swept off from the face of the land, and peace and goodwill restored.”

The Hon'ble THE PRESIDENT said:—“Gentlemen of the Council,—At the last meeting of the Council I made an appeal to Hon'ble Members to restrict the length of their speeches, and also to confine themselves, so far as might be possible, to matters directly arising out of the budget. That appeal has met with a ready and cordial response. I wish to associate myself with what has fallen from the Hon'ble Mr. Oldham on this matter. I desire to express my appreciation of the successful efforts which Hon'ble Members have made both to condense their remarks, and to confine them within the limits of the Financial Statement. It will be our duty to make such fitting return to them as we can, by according to their comments and suggestions the most attentive consideration in our power. Neither can I allow the occasion to pass without paying a tribute to the excellent sense and good temper which are manifest throughout the remarks of all the Hon'ble Members, notwithstanding that they were discussing a budget which, from causes beyond our control, presents little to attract the imagination or excite our enthusiasm. This is an excellent augury for the future. Hon'ble Members have wasted no time in crying over spilt milk, and have indulged in no recriminations in our adversity. There is all the more reason to hope that when better times return, and we have money to spend,

[*The President.*]

they will prove themselves equal to the greater trials and temptations of prosperity. We shall do our utmost to place those temptations in their way.

“Before touching on one or two points of detail which have arisen in the remarks of Hon’ble Members, I should like to make two remarks of more general character.

“Two Hon’ble Members—the Hon’ble Babu Radha Charan Pal and the Hon’ble Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur—have expressed disappointment at the restrictions which they consider I have sought to impose on the debate on this occasion. Gentlemen, I do not wish my remarks to be taken in that light. I am well aware that the privilege of free discussion of the affairs of the Province is highly esteemed by the non-official Members of the Council; and during many years a long series of Hon’ble Members have struggled to discharge their duty in this respect with advantage both to the public and to the Government and at the cost of no small labour to themselves. If the present constitution were going to remain unaltered, I should not propose for a moment to modify the practice which has grown up in response to a general demand. My point is—and I endeavoured to make it clear when I addressed Council on the last occasion—that when the new constitution is introduced (as will be the case before long), it will be neither necessary nor even possible to concentrate this discussion on the single occasion of the budget. It will not be necessary, because the Hon’ble Members will in future enjoy many opportunities of raising discussions on matters of public interest, opportunities which are not at present allowed under the statute. Moreover, it will not be possible; because if the members of the enlarged Councils attempted to discuss the whole affairs of the Province at the same length and with the same disregard of logical connection as heretofore, the budget debate must be interminably prolonged, while the proceedings would be liable to be involved in very undesirable confusion.

“I thought it would be good discipline if we were to begin without delay to accustom ourselves to the greater regularity and stricter attention to relevance which will be inevitable under the new constitution. There has never been any intention to take away any privilege which Members now possess. On the contrary, a primary object of the reforms is to enlarge and not to contract the opportunities for public discussion.

“The other point to which I desire to refer is this. I observe that at least two Hon’ble Members—the Hon’ble Member for the University and the Hon’ble Rai Kishori Lal Goswami Bahadur—have divided their remarks into two parts. In the first part they have dealt in a more or less general way with the broader features of the budget; while in the latter they have discussed more briefly a number of detailed points under different headings.

“Now, Gentlemen, under the present system we have nothing that can be described as the Committee stage of the budget, such as exists in the House of Commons or the French Chamber of Deputies. But under the new system there will be an arrangement approximating to the Committee stage; and it occurs to me that it might tend to facilitate business if the discussion of details, *i.e.*, points of relatively minor importance, were relegated to that stage, while the general debate might be reserved for the broader aspects of the budget as a whole. It seems to me that such a distribution of work would not only make the proceedings more orderly and businesslike, but that it would be more effective. For it is only at the Committee stage that any modifications of detail can really be introduced in the budget. At that stage it has not yet crystallized into its final form, and it will still be practicable to make minor modifications in it if such should commend themselves to the Council and the Government.

“Perhaps Hon’ble Members will kindly consider this suggestion at their leisure. There will be plenty of time before the new system comes into operation to let me know whether they think it feasible and likely to be beneficial.

“I will now refer to some of the remarks that have fallen from various Hon’ble Members to day. Most of those have been adequately replied to by the official Members of my Government, and I do not propose to touch upon them. But there are one or two which I desire to mention briefly.